

**MAUI REDEVELOPMENT AGENCY
REGULAR MEETING
DECEMBER 17, 2021**

A. CALL TO ORDER

The regular meeting of the Maui Redevelopment Agency (Agency) was called to order by Mr. Keone Ball, Chair, at approximately 1:01 p.m., Friday, December 17, 2021, online via BlueJeans Meeting ID: 988 398 036.

Mr. Keone Ball: Thank you. It's 1:01 p.m., December 17th, 2021. Welcome everybody to the Maui Redevelopment Agency meeting. And we are going to make an agenda item move around, taking Item D.3., and we'll move that to the beginning.

Ms. Erin Wade: I'm sorry, C.1. So we'll take New Business, Department of Planning for MAPA's project first because they're here now.

Mr. Ball: Okay. Sorry.

Mr. Wade: And then . . . (inaudible) . . . business, we can just move that one up.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY

Mr. Ball: I thought you said Park Maui, so no problem. So let's start with -- we called the meeting to order. We have -- if there is any public testimony, you may offer your public testimony now or you can wait for the agenda item to come up. You have three minutes to do your, say your peace. So if there's anyone that would like to testify now, let me know. Okay. Seeing none, public testimony is closed now. And we will move to Item C.1. Erin?

C. NEW BUSINESS

- 1. THE DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, requesting design review for the Maui Academy of Performing Arts proposed exterior building renovations and adjacent sidewalk work that is a part of other improvements including the addition of a 150 seat Black Box Theater, located at 2027 Main Street, Wailuku, Island of Maui, Tax Map Key (2) 3-4-013:086 (MRA 2021/0003) (S. Forsythe)**

Ms. Wade: Is Scott Forsythe on the call?

Mr. Scott Forsythe: I am here. I'm trying, I'm trying to get here. Give me a second, Erin. I'm trying to set this thing up, and every time you come in the room, it's . . . (inaudible) . . . As you can see we have all these new chairs in the back, but probably not likely to have any more big meetings in this conference room.

Okay, I think that's as good as I'm going to get here. Okay Erin.

Ms. Wade: Great. While -- thanks for being here. So the Department of Planning is here today to request design review for the Maui Academy of Performing Arts (MAPA) project. This is their black box theater project located at 2027 Main Street. Scott Forsythe is the project planner.

Mr. Forsythe: Yeah, sorry, Erin are you ready? Good afternoon everyone. Scott Forsythe, the planner with the Department of Planning. The item before you is a design review for MAPA's building at 2027 Main Street. They have a project, an all-encompassing project that is a black box theater for 150 seats and some internal remodeling that's happening at a building. However, the item that is before you is a design review for external work that they are proposing. Your agenda packet, there's three primary things you probably want to be referring to, and I imagine you've already reviewed it. There is the department's report. There are the Wailuku Redevelopment Design Guidelines that were included as an exhibit. And then there is Exhibit A, which is a MAPA's submission for the design. I'll note that yesterday we did upload to the agenda the consultant team's presentation on this item. And it looks very similar to Exhibit A and it is . . . (inaudible) . . . but there are a few minor details. And so the page numbers, the exact numbers do not match up. I'm going to ask that the consultant team, I believe Egbert is here or Kevin is here to point out any differences as they go through their presentations to keep you from not going back and forth here.

Referring to the department's report, page-6 of the report, I believe it is, it is the department's analysis of the design. There are these numbers that are reference to the design guidelines. You may have found other information within the design guidelines yourself to, to assess those proposed design elements with. I think the important thing here is that you're welcome to comment and provide recommendations on any portion of this project that you would like. However, there are a few items that the Department is looking to the MRA to make a determination on for conformance, the proposed project's conformance to the design guidelines. And those specific questions are identified at the bottom of page-13 into 14.

Let me just briefly touch on the design guidelines and the building. The building's appearance right now, it's nothing like it looked back in the 50's when it was the National Dollar Store. And your review here isn't to try and revert back to that original appearance. It's really just to make certain that what is being proposed conform to what the intent of the design guidelines and the vision is therefore of Wailuku Town here on Main Street.

So with that, that's my introduction. I'm going to turn it over to the project team, and Kevin, will that be you?

Mr. Kevin Teague: It will be. I think -- I don't see Carolyn's video feed on here. Carolyn, are you here?

Ms. Carolyn Wright: I'm -- I'm here. Yeah, I'm here. I don't know if you can see me or not, but --

Mr. Teague: There you are. Okay.

Ms. Wright: I'll kick this off. I'm Carolyn Wright. I'm the executive director for Maui Academy Performing Arts. And we just want to thank you, first of all, for doing this design review. This is a project that's been in the works since 1998. So we've been working on this for 20-what? Almost 24 years now and we are finally bringing it to fruition, and we're super excited to create a space that we hope will, will work as an anchor tenant for the revitalization of Wailuku. And those of you who know about MAPA know that we bring thousands and thousands of people into Wailuku, well pre-pandemic anyway, thousands of people. Literally every week, we had about 1,200 kids coming into our studios to take dance and drama classes and all of their parents. And we feel that by expanding our footprint in Wailuku, but just within the same building that we already own, we can make a big difference, I think, in terms of making Wailuku a really vital place to live and, and to work, and to play.

And some you may wonder what a black box theatre is. And basically a black box theatre is just an empty room. It's just a space that's outfitted to be a theatre with all the lights and sound equipment, but it has a flexible seating system. We don't have the black box theatre on Maui. The McCoy Theatre at the Maui Arts and Cultural Center was built to be a black box, but they put in a seating system that isn't flexible. So it really functions more like a traditional proscenium theatre. And the advantage of a black box theatre is that you can rearrange the seating to have as many or as few people as you want, which would be great if we ever have to, if we ever face the situation like we're facing right now where we have to be socially distanced in a theatre. It's easy to do that. It's also really easy to do any type of show there if we have children, performers, or adult performers. And we're excited to be working with our friends at Maui on Stage and the Lao Theatre to create a theatre district, if you will, for people to be able to come to Wailuku and have a choice of what they want to do at night; go to the Lao or go to MAPA's Blackbox Theatre.

We have been working really hard to raise a lot of money for this project and have been blessed with a lot of very generous donors who are making it possible to get us to this point where once we get through the permitting, we truly are, we are shovel ready. We're ready to go with this. And our, our vision is we chose Wailuku to, to make our home not only because we already own the building, but we, we chose it because we believe in Wailuku and we believe in the ability to, to bring people together through the arts is really powerful. And Wailuku, as a gathering place for so many, so many decades now, you know, going way back, we want to, we want to bring help bring Wailuku back to that place. And we're excited to be here. And Kevin is part of our consultant team. He's one of our architects. And I will turn it over to Kevin to share more details.

Mr. Kevin Teague: Okay. Yeah, very good. Hi, everyone. My name is Kevin Teague. I am an architect, one of two, collaborating on this project. A little bit about -- I won't I won't bore you with too many details -- but as Carolyn mentioned, this project history does date back to 1998. I was a part of an original project team in my, in my wee youth back in my early 20s. That was my introduction to MAPA's original vision and goal for this project. And I'm excited to still be here, still be a part of the team 20 years later, and very much looking forward to getting this one over the, over the finish line for them. So we certainly appreciate your input and your help in achieving that goal as well.

I apologize that I missed the first couple of minutes of the meeting. I was installing BlueJeans and, and putting my blue jeans, putting on my blue jeans. But I don't know if, and Scott, you may have mentioned it, am I meant to present over the medium or everyone's just flipping through themselves?

Mr. Forsythe: So if you have the power point or the PDF images of the slides you can screen share that to walk through it.

Mr. Teague: Okay.

Mr. Forsythe: I'm familiar with how to do it, I could bring it up on my end.

Mr. Teague: Let me see. I'm usually fairly tech savvy but let me, let me see if I can see this on the interface here. Okay, I got you. Just one second. Sorry everyone. Am I sharing anything yet?

Mr. Ball: It changed --. Oh, it's getting better.

Mr. Teague: Getting warmer. I think that shall open it.

Ms. Wade: It's great to see you. But just in case you don't have the bandwidth to see your beautiful face and the power point, if . . . (inaudible) . . . you might want to turn your . . . (inaudible) . . . off.

Mr. Teague: Turn my camera down. Okay, got you. So are you able -- is the presentation up now?

Ms. Wade: It still shows the . . . (inaudible) . . . Do you have the file on your end?

Mr. Forsythe: Kevin, if you would like, I do have a PDF and I could flip through as you lead.

Mr. Teague: Yeah, that'll be fine. Sorry, I was hoping to not have to dictate next slide to you, but if you don't mind, that's, that's great.

Mr. Forsythe: No worries. Alright. Let me give it a shot.

Mr. Teague: Sure.

Mr. Forsythe: Can you see that?

Mr. Ball: Yeah.

Mr. Teague: Yes. Okay, very good. So you can go ahead and skip into the, the third slide where we have the location plan. I'm, I'm sure you're all pretty familiar with the site. It's just here at the corner of Main and Market or thereabouts across the street from what, what when we started this project was a municipal parking lot and is very much in the process of becoming a much anticipated garage. So congratulations to the town on that. So we know that this is very much the downtown Wailuku core.

If you go ahead and go to the next slide for me, we have a footprint of the existing building. It's a relatively landlocked building. Main Street there on the left hand side of your screen. And along with the, the main entrance vestibule, which will be one important topic for us to review this evening or this afternoon.

We'll go ahead. Go ahead to the next slide. We'll get into the project. So we did a land survey there. That's a little bit of technical information for those, if you'd like to read any kind of the any of the elevation markers or understand a little bit about the topography, the topography of the site. Something that will come up this evening is the, is this is the running slope of the sidewalk along Main Street and some of the challenges there of creating an ADA accessible entrance from, from that sidewalk. So this would be an important reference for, for that conversation. Let's go ahead, Scott, to the project description.

As Carolyn mentioned, the primary goal of the project is to get a black box theater into what was originally built as a warehouse. I doubt many of you have been inside the building in its current incarnation, but the front two-thirds of the building are, are currently a large open storage space. And the rear one-third of the building currently houses some of MAPA's dance programs. So for us and understanding that MAPA is a nonprofit, we had to be very conscious about how we approached the project and how we could get really the most bang for the buck. And so the project consists primarily of renovating the front two-thirds of the building where it was a little bit easier to do what we needed to do in terms of installing a black box theater, in terms of installing a lobby and associated bathrooms. And so we really had to look at what ways we could, we could get the most into the space. And so this will become an important criteria for us as especially as we start to look at the vestibule design, which will come up a little bit later.

In addition to these programmatic elements, there are a number of just infrastructural upgrades that we're doing between roofing and, roofing installation, HVAC upgrades, new

electrical work. So a lot of this kind of stuff that's really going to improve the efficiency of the building. We have a lot of sound concerns being that it is a theater. So a lot of this kind of infrastructural stuff that isn't some aesthetic, but it's also stuff that, of course, we have to spend money on. Okay, so next slide.

So this gives you a little bit of a visual. This is our, this is our current floor plan, and more or less what's been submitted to, to the Planning Department for approval. You'll see in the front two-thirds -- I won't spend a lot of time on this -- but the left two-thirds, as you see in the plan, again, Main Street being at the far left. This is where we have the lobby street just off of the, the Main Street vestibule, bathrooms toward the top there, and then a black, a large open space, black box theater. So, yeah, like I said, we'll get to it in terms of the, the, the vestibule conversation. But you can start to see that for us to achieve a meaningful sort of communal space, i.e. a lobby within this building, the relationship of the vestibule to the lobby, to the black box became a very critical study for us. And, and I think you'll start to see as we get further into the presentation what, what starts to attribute to the design and kind of form of the vestibule. Let's go ahead to the next slide.

Scott, do you want to --? There we go. So something that that I don't know how familiar everybody is, and this is something I learned only fairly recently as well, was that when the National Dollar Store was built, what had been on the site previously was the Alexander House Settlement. And apparently that was a very much a, an important community facility. It was something that that contributed to, to a sense of community in Wailuku. And it's interesting because I think that in this project, we have a real opportunity to re-foster a sense of community on, on this, on this property. And so I think that there's something kind of, kind of nice and kind of circular about, about the trajectory of this site. And so in some ways, we're reengaging the importance of the site by digging back a communal aspect of it. If we can go to the next slide.

So the National Dollar Store and here are some images of what you know, what the Alexander House Settlement building had looked like, and then the National Dollar Store as it was built. So there's a pretty big, a pretty big differential here in, in the, the building typology, the aesthetic and, and what it meant to the fabric, presumably of, of Wailuku. Next slide.

So here we're calling out the National Dollar Store in its iteration. I believe this is in 1960 or 1962 photo. Yeah, 1960. And what you'll see there is, is an interesting rendition of the building. Well certainly in its original form, but it's a slight variation on what you see today, right? So the character of the building from its inception was it was a very spare, very industrial sort of, sort of building. And it's, it was always a one off sort of building, right. It was a building where you probably wouldn't have known that it was in Wailuku. It could have been anywhere. But interestingly, like that building has a history as well, right. So it's, so part of our response architecturally is to, in a sense, honor the history of this building, even though it might have been displaced at the time, it does have a history and it is still

part of Wailuku's historical fabric. So what we're calling out here is, of course, the despair industrial character. The existing awning is very much like what it is today. And you'll also notice below there is a retail storefront that was entirely a glass and aluminum system, which is something that we're, we're looking to, I don't want to say every restore because we're not, we're not doing for a theater. It would, it would be counterproductive for us to have so much glass in the front of the building. But we are looking to restore a glass and aluminum sort of aesthetic to the front facade. Can we have the next slide?

And so this is what we see today. I can't really speak to what color the building was in 1960. I haven't seen documentation of that. The photo reads as though it's a fairly neutral medium, maybe a gray color. As it is today, we have these very saturated coral and salmon tones. We have some non-original ornamentation in the both of the, the cornices and the, the center of the building. You will notice that there's some non-original signage and the, the base of the building has essentially already been infilled from its original retail storefront. Next slide.

This is an elevation of what we are proposing to -- how we're proposing to change the facades. This is the demo elevation, if you will. Our proposal is to remove all of the non-original ornamentation of the building. We are intending to replace all of the existing windows, and that's in part because we do want to bring them both back to the, the aluminum, the original aluminum aesthetic, but also to get in soundproof and much more energy efficient windows. We are proposing to keep in the existing awning; that's a very important piece of the existing structure. And replacing, replacing the vestibule essentially in kind. And we'll, we'll get to that in just a second. Next slide, please.

This is the drawing of the proposed facade. In fact, let's go ahead to the next, I think, to the next slide, because we can look at the --. Yeah, let's look at them in a little bit more detail. I'll catch up with you on my slides here. Okay, so for the proposed exterior elements -- windows and doors. So as I mentioned just a minute ago, the design guidelines are pretty specific about wanting to see wood frame, wood framed windows as that's, you know, per a number of the typologies in Wailuku. That would be the correct choice. Throughout a lot of the Main Street and Market Street corridors, you do see original aluminum storefronts throughout. And so we wanted to show you a representation of those just for your reference that we're not kind of going too far out of bounds with, with that design decision. Next slide, please.

And so here we're calling out the different, the four different types or locations of the windows. All of these go in their, in their current openings, so we're not creating any new openings, again, with the exception of the vestibule. Next slide, please. This just gives a little more information about the specification of each window, which was specifically requested for the presentation, and a little bit more information about, about the sizing and operation. Next slide, please.

Okay, so for the vestibule, what you may have noticed, it may not have been super easy to, to see so far in the presentation is that the vestibule -- and this was something that was done only in the past 20 years -- was significantly deepened for I'm not even, I don't even actually know the exact reason as to why the vestibule was brought in that much, that much deeper. It may have been to achieve ADA accessibility. But what that does is actually creates a break in the, in the uniformity of the street wall, which is something the design guidelines very much encourage is that we, that we maintain or reinforce as possible. You'll notice, and we'll see a full facade elevation here shortly, but we do introduce a curved form for the vestibule versus a more angled entrance. And this is a bit of a payoff of the, off of the rec, off of the rectangular shapes that are very evident in the facade. And it offers a little bit more of a subtle and we think maybe a bit more of a graceful entrance into the building. And it also plays off of some of the other curved forms that are, that are evident in the neighborhood.

Another point to consider is that there's a terrazzo decorative detail in the sidewalk. And this is something that I believe a number of, I don't know if it's different agencies in the city, but there have been complaints to the city apparently that this does get slippery when it's wet. And it's also pretty broken up at the moment. Anyway, not a particularly nice feature for, for the building. So we'll take a look at some of these photos here. Scott, if you don't mind.

Okay, so -- so these are showing the shallow entrances off of existing buildings in, in Wailuku town. You can see that much unlike our current, current vestibule, they end up, on average, maybe three to four feet deep. And it really keeps, keeps that, that street while feeling very consistent throughout the downtown. Next slide, please.

Here we're showing some examples of various curves that you, that you see in the facades of existing buildings downtown, between the Iao theater, the bank across the street. They do happen pretty frequently in elevation. They happen in plan a little bit less sometimes in some of the municipal buildings, you will see curves in the plan. But we think that that does, that is pretty sympathetic to, to what happens already downtown. Next slide, please.

As far as the orientation of the vestibule, something we felt that was important to achieve was to maintain an aspect of the symmetry on the front facade. And so the way that we've achieved that was by --. Let me take one step back. So based on some of the interior spatial needs and I said before, right, that we're trying to put a lot of program into this building just to make it a successful, both and successful, a successful black box, but also a successful community space at the lobby. In order to, to really maximize out our space, one way to do that was to reconsider just how deep does this vestibule will need to be. Part of, part of the challenge of, of looking at the, the planning of the lobby was that based on the --. Man, it gets a little hard to explain verbally so we can, we can do some slides that might clarify it. But based on the running pitch of the sidewalk out front, it creates a very challenging relationship between the interior building to the floor plan, which is obviously leveled, and where they actually conjoins or connects to the running pitch of the sidewalk.

The farther up the Main Street you go, the easier of a connection it is to make, to create an ADA accessible entrance to the building. So right now, with the, with the doors being centered in the building, it means you actually need a much longer stretch to get to the floor height of the interior, if that makes sense. So by shifting the façade, or by, by shifting the doors further up toward the Lao Valley, we're able to lessen the depth that we need to still achieve an ADA accessible entrance to the building, which is obviously it's important to map it regardless of the fact that it's also required, right.

So, so that explains kind of functionally why we need to make a move like this in order to also avoid eating up half of what would be the lobby space with an exterior vestibule that tends to attract, you know, other sorts of probably unwanted activities that are as dark and tucked away spaces tend to do so. That gives you a little bit of a primer on how we've arrived at this vestibule solution. It was important to us to maintain -- and this is coming, coming back to where I just dropped off -- it was important for us to maintain a sense of symmetry across the facade. And so we did, we did keep the vestibule, the recessed aspect of it, symmetrical on the building. But the doors themselves are just off center within that, within symmetrical vestibule. So let's look at that. I think we have a slide of that next . . . (inaudible) . . . We'll get there.

Okay, so one more point about the about the vestibule is the terrazzo detailing in the existing sidewalk. This was something that was always originally a large, a large arc, I guess, close to a semicircle, right, on, on the existing sidewalk. That sidewalk has been very much patched over to probably, as you can see here, other city infrastructural elements needed to be installed into that or added into the terrazzo itself, it has been very much kind of chipped away at or it probably what was a very beautiful element at one point, no longer exists in that way. And so between the fact that it does, that does create a slip hazard and the fact that it's already fairly torn up, we're proposing to return the sidewalk to a DOT standard sidewalk and take the opportunity to regrade the sidewalk such that -- and not really regrade the sidewalk, but regrade our connection to the entrance in order to make for a fully accessible ADA entrance. Next slide, please.

And this just basically is a graphic depicting -- the light gray here is what we propose to return to the DOT standard sidewalk. We do propose to bring --. We're using a terrazzo, if we can afford it, we're going to use a terrazzo at the, at the lobby interior floor. And just a little invitation from the outside of the building to the inside, we do plan to put terrazzo well underneath the vestibule where we are imagining it's less of a slip hazard and probably it isn't subjected to rain and the elements. Next slide.

And this is where we get to the issue of the National Dollar Store emblem. The current location of the emblem is very much front and center in the existing vestibule. And it's something that, again, the terrazzo has been chewed up around the emblem. The emblem itself is, and I don't know how many of you are familiar with, with kind of the composite make up of it, it is essentially a cut, a series of cut metal pieces that seem to be inlaid into

terrazzo bed. So it's not one kind of large circular piece of signage, but it's in fact a number of different pieces of metal. As it sits, it does create an inhibitor to the ADA accessibility that we're hoping to achieve within this new vestibule design. And so this icon here or this graphic shows you essentially where it exists relative to what our proposed new sidewalk layout looks like. So this is a little bit for reference, just so you get a sense of where, where the new the new entrance is relative to the emblem there as it sits in the terrazzo. Can we go to the next slide, please?

Okay, so the rooftop HVAC equipment, we understood very well from the design guidelines that we wanted that to be screened from, from any street view. So in the plan here, again, Main Street being at the left side of your, of your screen, we need to add two new HVAC units to the building. And typically for HVAC units, you probably know this, you typically want to locate them at the corners of the buildings. That's where you're able to get this steel dunnage across, and the equipment sits on those, on those steel beams. They're using the parapet to support the beams, which then accommodate the HVAC units. So because our rear two are already being used by the rear half of the building, the two new units would have to go at the front of the building. We're proposing to do a series of screens that are, that wrap around the entire perimeter of the of, the new HVAC units so there's no chance of their being seen from the sidewalk. And I think they actually become a pretty interesting architectural element on the roof. We can go to the next slide. That's just calling out the specifications and the sizes and location. For your reference, we do have and showing the, the screening element relative to the sidewalk, and the, and the vista there, how, how they will actually be screened, how the units will be screened by the, the screening device there.

Okay, colors and materials. So we are proposing to continue the use of a stucco material. Here called out is a painted cement plaster. Very similar to what the building, how the building exists now with the material or what the construction is of that front facade. I'm just doing something a little different in terms of the shape. And we're looking at a, a fairly neutral but a dark gray color with a blue accent at the entry. What we've done here is show -- and you can go to the next slide. That's fine. -- a number of buildings. And I realized a couple, only a couple of these fall within the Wailuku Historic District, but particularly the, the Calvary Church, and then the 808 On Main which I whenever I visit, I spend way too much of my paycheck at 808 On Main, frankly. You're lucky to have it there. But any case, looking at a little bit at how some of these dark blue and gray tones already exist in the downtown for a little bit of a point of reference for us. And then if we can go to the next slide, we have the proposed palette where, again, we have this dark gray. It's called Baby Seal Black from Benjamin Moore as the primary facade color. We have the Clearest Ocean Blue as our vestibule color, stainless steel windows and coming back and using the Baby Seal Black again for, for the screening device. And if we can have the next slide, please.

And this then is the ultimate proposed facade including all the elements that we just reviewed. So something that I, that I probably should have led with is that a large part of the inspiration for, for the design of the building and how we're treating the character of, of the

facade is very much -- has very much to do with both the brand, but also to the mission of MAPA itself. It's an organization that really seeks to, to inspire people. It seems to be a very, a place where bold creations can exist. And I think it was important for MAPA, and this is something they expressed early on, is they really wanted this to become something of an anchor, something of a beacon, something of a place of inspiration for, for people in, around Maui to be able to come to this new creative arts district. This is something that it's been part of their vision for 20 years. And so taking an existing building and trying to return it to a little bit of some of the spirit character that, you know, that certainly has always been its history. I know that it probably reads like, you know, a little, I don't know if it's a bit of a shocker, if that's the right term to use. But, but really engaging the spirit character of it and understanding it as a little bit of like a blank canvas. It's almost similar to the black box program itself. It's a very, it's a highly flexible sort of program. It's a highly flexible sort of space. And in that same way, that that lends itself to a facade that also is equally malleable and equally flexible. And that, and that's largely in terms of its, its design aesthetic. What you'll see a little bit is that we're trying to engage the sense of mystery by doing a layered facade. And so you'll see the vestibule, there's a double height portion that actually almost kind of hides behind the existing, the existing facade. So you can see where the two windows there up above. There's actually another set of, another oversized entry system that exists just behind, just behind those windows. And so it's almost like this layering effect. It starts to build kind of the mystery and the intrigue of place, but it also, but it also allows us to, to retain the history of, of the spare industrial character building. And we're hoping that it just becomes this, this unique, the start of the theatrical experience starting on the outside of the building.

So I think, I think that covers it in terms of the design presentation. We did include a number of slides hereafter just to orient you to the context. So I, I'll go ahead and I'll leave it there. And Carolyn, I don't know if I -- did I miss anything in terms of --?

Ms. Wright: No.

Mr. Teague: Yeah.

Ms. Wright: Yeah, that's great.

Mr. Teague: Okay, good. So I'm happy to turn it over to any questions, any comments, or however, however, your show, however you'd like to carry forward.

Mr. Ball: Okay, thank you, Kevin, for that. We will open this up for public testimony at this time if anybody would like to testify. You will have three minutes. Please identify yourself. Anyone? No one? Okay. Seeing none, we will close public testimony, and we will take questions, comments from -- . Or do we want to do the staff recommendations right now. Erin? And then questions or questions and then the staff recommendation?

Ms. Wade: You can probably . . . (inaudible) . . . ask any questions . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Ball: Your mic keeps cutting out, but I think you said take questions first. Okay, questions from the commissioners. Any questions?

Ms. Gwen Hiraga: Yeah. Yeah. I just, I have a comment on the colors and the façade. That dark gray looks -- or dark or that black. But what are we calling it? Baby Seal Black looks very dark. It --. Well, I think it looks very dark, especially compared to the buildings that are adjacent to it, you know, which is a lighter tannish color. Not, not that you have to have the same color, but it is different, and why it's so, such a dark, the Baby Seal Black?

Mr. Teague: Yeah, I would say that part, of part of where the, the color choice came in again, it's the idea of creating this something of an anchor for the notion of Wailuku as, as an arts district on Maui. I know that already exists to some extent, but it's to, to create this wow factor, to say things, to almost say, hey, we're here, let's do this. Let's get this ball rolling. What is kind of committing -- it's the color of the commitment. And I think it also lends itself to the commitment of the organization to be the anchor for, for this art . . . (inaudible) . . . in, in Wailuku. And I think that it's, it's just attributes or it's, or it's meant to signify, but also activate that kind of, that kind of bold innovation for Wailuku.

Ms. Hiraga: Okay. One other comment then. If that's the case, to me, having aluminum around the windows make it more apparent that it's aluminum and the design guidelines say, you know, guidelines is for wooden. So I would have a concern with that because it appears to -- it makes it more -- it stands out more on the dark Baby Seal Black.

Mr. Teague: You're saying that the, the two kind of exaggerate each other maybe is what your point is.

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah. That's just my comment.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Keone, if I may, I have one.

Mr. Ball: Go ahead, George.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: I realize what you guys saying about that Dollar Store sign. I realize what we saying about in the past that they haven't taken care of it, they haven't done anything. So I'm gathering that you guys are requesting that they will be removed altogether. Are there -- have there been any type of, of looking into the matter as to how we could keep that and keep it up to the proper standards? I don't, I don't know about you guys, but I can remember walking into Dollar Store -- and just to say this is my age -- but that, that's, that was a prominent store in Wailuku in that time. Because others didn't do anything to rectify or keep it in shape, does it mean that we should get rid of it altogether? That's my question.

Ms. Wright: Are you --? Can I ask, can I ask you a clarifying question? Are you talking about that Dollar Store logo itself or that terrazzo kind of half-moon or --

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: The one on, the one on the sidewalk.

Mr. Ball: The logo.

Ms. Wright: The terrazzo on the sidewalk.

Mr. Ball: The logo itself.

Ms. Wright: I assume that was County work that may have, that may have broken up that terrazzo because you can see the sewer, the sewer manhole there. So I think it was the County.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Well, I'm looking to the Dollar, the Dollar Store insignia --

Ms. Wright: Oh.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: -- that it's still there. That portion. I'm not too worried about the rest of it. But again, my point is, because others didn't even take the time to keep it up, to get rid of it altogether.

Mr. Ball: Well I think it was stated that it might be a slip hazard, right? Or an ADA inhibitor, entrance inhibitor.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Again, Keone, I remember going inside there, it wasn't a slip hazard. So . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Ball: No, I remember going there too. I remember going in there too, but we can try and see if we can --. What is the Historical Society say or the Historical Division? Do they have any comments on that?

Ms. Wright: We spoke with Annalise about it, and it's not a building that is really suitable for the historic registry. It's been altered fairly dramatically from its original. But when we first bought the building, it wasn't 50 years old yet. Now it is 50 years old or more than that. She didn't have anything specific to say about the Dollar symbol, especially because even though the Dollar Store, I mean, I remember going in there and buying my Christmas presents and, and Christmas ornaments 30 years ago. But because the, the Dollar Store itself wasn't even owned by a local family or, you know, it was a, it was a San Francisco businessman who wanted to come to vacation on Maui. So he built, he built one here just so that he could justify his trips to come over here.

And so when we were doing our research on the history of the property, we were super excited about the fact that before the Dollar Store, it was the Alexander House Settlement, which really was, it was the first kindergarten on Maui. It was where it housed the boys and -- the Boy Scouts and the Girl Scouts. It had -- it was, it was where a lot of the sports came from because they built the swimming pool back there and the gym. Of course, not on our property, but back behind us. And so this idea that was a gathering place and a place where people who, who came to Maui to work in the, on the plantations would have a place to be integrated into, into Wailuku and into the fabric of Maui culture. We're pretty excited about tapping into that history rather than a commercial, you know, a store or a department store owned by a guy from San Francisco. And not to play the memories of the Dollar Store because for those of us who have been here for a long time, we remember going in there and, and there are sweet memories of that. But we're --.

The other thing about the settlement house that was there before that, the original community theater movement in this country started in a settlement house in Chicago. And so this movement to, to bring small theater and tell the stories of the people who are here started in a settlement house. So the fact that we're going to be building a little theater on the property of the settlement house is exciting for us.

Back to the Dollar sign, however, I, I don't know how we will maintain the ADA accessibility and keep the Dollar sign. If we could, we would, because we think it's fun. You know, we like it.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: I guess my question is, I didn't hear from you guy's presentation if you guys looked into the matter of saving it and correcting it or not. I didn't pick it up.

Ms. Wright: Oh, I'm sorry that we left that out. We absolutely did because it is a charming sort of thing to have in the entrance, and it, and it does have a sweet place in our hearts and the hearts of the community. But, but we are obligated, of course, to have ADA accessibility. And there's, there was no -- we looked at so many different incarnations for that, for that vestibule, and we couldn't figure out a way. In fact, it was one of our charges to the architects was see if we can maintain the Dollar sign and have ADA accessibility, and we couldn't.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Okay, my suggestion is that be added in your guys presentation.

Ms. Wright: Thank you.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Because that's a big point that caught me. And if it's not in your presentation, I'm taking the point that you guys didn't even look into it.

Ms. Wright: Oh, yeah. Okay, thank you for that advice. We appreciate that. Yeah, that's a good idea.

Mr. Teague: Yeah. And we did, we did definitely --. You know, we looked at a number of different iterations of, you know, of the vestibule design, the, you know, of how, of how we could make that work and keep it in place. Because we knew, you know, we're aware of, you know, of, of how that there is fondness for, for, for the emblem. But part of --. And we even looked at possible ways of, you know, is it possible to, to remove that piece of terrazzo and reinstall it? Is it possible to do a lot of different things? And part of what makes it kind of a challenge, I would hate to promise anything along those lines because, A, I think it's going to be a very fairly fragile thing to actually try to take up. And if we were, another thought that I had had even recently was, well, we could try to because it's individual pieces of metal, right. And so as soon as you tried to take that out, I'm worried that the whole thing starts to just to or how do you how, do you get that out cleanly from, from it being embedded in terrazzo, right. So there just aren't a lot of good options. And I actually think what would end up happening is we would have to actually entirely recreate it, like recut the metal in order to relay it into new terrazzo. And it's almost like, well, at that point, like, it's a little bit we recreationists. And I just don't know if that's also to the point of, of what historic preservation is in that way. So, I mean, that's for, you know, that's, that's certainly the purview of your committee more than it is of, you know, of me. So, but I, but I do, I do want to just underscore that we've looked at a number of different iterations and ways to, you know, ways to keep it, to facilitate the, you know, the honoring of it, the memorializing of it, and yeah. And, you know, would there be other options of creating like a --? Are there, there, there are many examples of where of installing plaques where things have stood previously. I don't know if something like that might be, might be a good compromise solution. You know, if it's something that honors both the memory of the Settlement House and of the National Dollar Store, kind of articulating their historical significance and doing some, some sort of like a placard, you know, in the vestibule, if that, if that might be a way to, to, to, to kind of thread that needle. I think MAPA would be open to that.

Ms. Hiraga: Keone?

Mr. Ball: Go ahead Gwen.

Ms. Hiraga: Okay, so I'm glad you brought that up about a placard because I, I didn't like the description of how 2027 Main Street history. You talk about or the presentation mentions that when the Settlement House and the Dollar Store -- while the Settlement House and the Dollar Store each existed at 2027 Main Street for approximately 15 years, the contributions of the Dollar Store to our community pale in comparison. I find that offensive; pale in comparison to the significant historical contributions the Settlement House had on, on the, on the island. You know, it was, Dollar Store was a part of our history, whether you agree or not. And I think that, you know --. So what are you doing to make sure that people remember that the Alexander House Settlement building was there before? How would anybody know?

Ms. Wright: Like Kevin mentioned, there is a possibility that we can create a little historical section of the vestibule or inside the lobby that shows the varying uses, the various uses of this property. Dollar Store, Alexander House Settlement and whatever happened before 1900 when the Alexander House Settlement was built. But just in our historical research, I know there's a difference between I think, historical significance and nostalgia. And, Gwen, I have probably the same nostalgia for the Dollar Store as, as you do. I loved shopping there and Wailuku, you know, having lived in Wailuku for a very long time back then, it was it was an important part of my, my weekly life there. And so I, I understand that completely.

And MAPA, we are, we are storytellers, you know, we are theater people. And we're here to share the stories of, of all kinds of people. And so we want to, we want to honor the history of the Dollar Store. We want to honor the history of Alexander House . . . (inaudible) . . . because we're doing that too, but we don't have information yet. So we're open really to honoring the history. And I'm sorry that you felt offended by the way that was worded. That's certainly not our intention at all.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Again, you know, for me, my biggest concern is that there's no mention in your report about what you guys did to try and with the signage, that logo. I think if, if it was in there, I wouldn't even have a problem with it. But it gave me the impression that you guys didn't really look into it. Now, I hear Kevin telling me that they did quite a bit of research, but it's not even mentioned. And I don't, I don't want to create . . . (inaudible) . . . for somebody else to come across and say because of the fact that you didn't do this, we, we're not going to accept it. I feel that you've got to explain what you're doing so that we all understand. And in this particular case, something is left out. And I agree with Gwen, you know, when you historical difference, I don't remember that house, okay. I do remember the Dollar Store. I remember going there. I remember my family taking a lot . . . (inaudible) . . . going there. It was before Ben Franklin, before K-Mart, before everything. It was the store. So it is a significant --

Ms. Wright: Yeah. . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Ball: You're too young George.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: I have no problem with what you guys are doing. I think you guys missed the boat on certain items to be brought up, and Gwen brought up a good point. Thank you. That's all I have.

Mr. Ball: You're too young, George, that's why. That's why don't remember.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Yeah.

Mr. Ball: I have a couple of questions. When this is done and we have the rend, the rendering of the front, what kind of lighting do you have there? Because I'm assuming most

of the stuff is going to be at night, maybe, right, or you will have shows at night? And then what kind of -- do you have, you know, like they have billboards, right. This is what's coming next kind of thing. Do we have anything planned like that for the front or, you know, like the movie theaters have the little things, or is it all going to be interior? But more so what is the lighting of this? Because this street is pretty dark, right? They have a lot of old lights on that, on the, on Main Street. So anyway.

Mr. Teague: Yeah, that's a, that's a good question, a good concern. So there is, there's existing lighting recessed into the underside of the, the existing awning. And so our intention is to replace that and to make it brighter. The vestibule would be lit as well by it, by its own independent system. I don't think we have a design for that because I guess, I guess, we've considered that technically interior since it's within the perimeter of the property line. And one thing that we -- we originally did have some, some signage proposed for the front of the building and owing to some other work that we've subsequently done over at 2050, we learned of the, the open source lighting -- or I'm not sure if I'm saying that correctly -- but to where you can't actually see the, the, the light source. And so we're reconsidering what we're doing for signage there and it probably won't be something that's particularly, you know, we're not going to be lighting up the, the Hawaiian skies with, with any new signage there. And I think we're trying to be a little bit sensitive to, you know, just the concerns of, you know, how do we, how do we address, you know, an ambient level of light that's good for community and good for safety without being disruptive to, you know, to the valley, essentially. So we're, we're walking that line. And I think our focus is primarily on making sure the sidewalk stays lit more so than the building. It's like, you know, the upper portion. And I think that probably addresses most of your, you know, your question. But, you know, certainly with signage and we've understood to that, that's a separate permit. So that'll be something that will, you know, what kind of dig into, you know, through that, to that process as well.

Mr. Ball: Okay, any further questions from the Commissioners. Okay, seeing none, who wants to do the staff report, Scott or Erin? Scott?

Mr. Forsythe: All right. Okay, I am back. Thank you, Kevin. Thank you, Carolyn.

Mr. Teague: Thank you.

Mr. Forsythe: So regarding the staff report, Keone, I'm not sure how you would like to go about it. I have the analysis portion beginning on page-6, and I wasn't certain if you wanted to walk through this or has your independent review, like, are you guys comfortable with it? Or how you want to proceed with that?

Mr. Ball: I was thinking just the recommendations, but what do you guys think? Gwen, George, do you guys want to go through the whole thing, or do you want to just go right through the recommendation?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: I can go with the recommendation.

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah. Recommendations is fine. And I think Scott has pretty much laid out, you know, what he wanted comments on.

Mr. Ball: Yeah.

Ms. Hiraga: Or do you want to have comments from the action items as noted?

Mr. Forsythe: They're -- correct. You will make comments on the action items. However, some of those action items are identified --

Ms. Hiraga: -- in your recommendation.

Mr. Forsythe: -- on determinations and recommendations.

Ms. Hiraga: Yes.

Mr. Forsythe: And for those items, I do, I am requesting the MRA to make a determination.

Ms. Hiraga: That's fine. Okay, so MRA determinations and recommendations, starting at page-13, is that what you're saying?

Mr. Forsythe: Correct.

Ms. Hiraga: Okay.

Mr. Forsythe: So if you want me to walk through these, I can. Or how would you like to --

Mr. Ball: Yeah, that would be good, Scott. Thank you.

Mr. Forsythe: Okay, so within the analysis portion, we did bring up the aluminum window frames and whether they are appropriate or not. They're along Main Street. There aren't too many buildings that have aluminum frames, but there are a few. And there are some also that are on Market Street. And I imagine that some of those were probably, well, not all of them, but I'm sure some of them were wood. And over time were replaced by aluminum or depending on the year they were built, they were just built with aluminum. However, the design guidelines itself that makes reference to wood frame windows. The way that building exists at the moment, it's just stuccoed over and whatever it is underneath, I don't know. So, yeah, what we're asking is, are aluminum window frames appropriate for this building?

Mr. Ball: Gwen?

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah, I have a comment on that. I don't think it's appropriate, you know, in line with the guidelines. And if there was some way to, I think, Kevin mentioned -- you mentioned a darker aluminum. There were two types of aluminum that you were going to be using. Did I not hear it correctly?

Mr. Teague: No. I don't think we proposed a different, a different aluminum in, in this particular color scheme.

Ms. Hiraga: Okay. So then I'll go back to my initial comment about the building color, the façade, the aluminum will really stand out, I think, the contrast. And even if there are some buildings that already have aluminum, I don't know that they are consistent with the guidelines either. I just have a concern. I'm not -- if it comes to a vote, I'm not voting no, but I just have a concern for --.

Mr. Ball: Yeah, I would echo you, Gwen. I mean, I don't, I don't --. When I look at some of those pictures, some of those aluminum doors and such, it's just because they're old, right. I mean, they haven't changed them out. I mean, this is -- if we're refurbishing this building, we should use modern means. I don't know. That's my opinion. Yes. But --

Mr. Teague: Do you mind if I interject briefly?

Mr. Ball: Please do.

Mr. Teague: I was just going to say I don't, I don't know to what extent it matters to the, the Commission that the original storefront was aluminum and glass. So in a sense, like in my mind, the trajectory is that we're trying to realign it a little bit, you know, to the original aesthetic, and in that way, trying to be, I don't know, be true to, to the history of the building. And I guess for us, wood just didn't seem kind of the inherent choice, you know, in that direction. So maybe it's just the confusion for us about what, you know, what the design guidelines are, kind of what the some of the purpose, some of the purposes of that are. You know, if it's about kind of a new vision for what a downtown Wailuku looks like or if it's kind of retaining or trying to return to something that that did exist, you know what I mean?

Mr. Ball: Yeah, I do. And that's probably one of the problems that we have with that is this. Because it's hard to say, right, for a building that that of that age, right. I mean, some stuff is historical, some, like you said, when you first bought, it wasn't historical, now it is, right. Well, you know, was is that really historical, right? I mean, what -- in fact, to Kevin's point, what are we trying to get? Where are we trying to go with it, right? What are we trying to achieve at the end of what this street looks like on the front? So just some thoughts, I guess more so. Go ahead, Scott. Continue, please.

Mr. Forsythe: And so is, is it possible to get a determination as to if the aluminum frame windows are appropriate or not?

Ms. Hiraga: Well, I, I said I don't think it's appropriate per our guidelines. The building when you bought it may have had it. But those design guidelines -- and correct me if I'm wrong, Erin and Scott -- weren't in place at that time when the Dollar Store or whenever it was put in. I'm not, I'm not absolutely sure about the time frame. So it could have been pre the design guidelines. I'm not sure.

Mr. Forsythe: Correct. The design guidelines were produced in 2006.

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah. And so I would think that we should be following the design guidelines.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: My, my question would be, to the design guidelines, is why do we have it if you're not going to follow it? It's simple as that. We can always make amendments to recommendations. But as of right now, the design guidelines specify one way. We should be looking at it. If there's concern, then they should come up with some idea as to how we can adjust the guidelines. But it doesn't make any sense to have guidelines if we're not going to follow them.

Mr. Ball: So what does the guidelines say?

Mr. Forsythe: Going back to the analysis section on page-10 of the department report, I pulled out the pieces that I could find information on. And on page-45, there's a statement that many of the windows in Wailuku's older buildings have been replaced with larger plate glass windows, жалousies, aluminum and or vinyl framed windows that are not historic diminish the character of Wailuku's traditional architecture. Page-45, windows should be constructed of wood or wood muntins, frames, sashes, and sills. Vinyl and aluminum should not be used.

Mr. Ball: Well, there's your answer then.

Ms. Hiraga: There's your answer.

Mr. Ball: What can kind of cost difference is that? Do we know? Is one --

Mr. Teague: I would assume. I would assume wood is actually a fairly more expensive.

Mr. Ball: Because it has to be handmade, right, as opposed to like okay, here it is, framed in, push it in, right, kind of thing.

Mr. Teague: The details are just different. That consumes the cost of materials is just different. Aluminum is a pretty inexpensive material. Yeah.

Ms. Wright: Do you think those design guidelines are appropriate even for the more industrial kind of buildings that exist in Wailuku? You know, like, is it appropriate to put wood framed doors and windows on a building that never had it? If we were a plantation style building, I could understand, of course, we want to be true to the historic integrity of that style. But I'm just wondering if this is -- and it's not my place to say this -- but I just wonder if it's sort of a flaw in the, in the design guidelines that it's not taking into consideration that there were buildings built in the 50s like the Dollar Store that aren't part of the regular vernacular?

Mr. Ball: Well, I mean, that's, yeah, it's obvious because if you look around Wailuku, you showed a bunch of pictures of it, right, there's all this aluminum all over the place. So and those are more industrial type stuff, right. I think what we're probably looking at is, is the color of it, right? I mean --

Ms. Wright: So if the color were --. I mean this is, this is a question for, for all of you. If the color weren't as dark so there weren't that stark contrast between that Baby Seal Black and the aluminum windows, I wonder if it would make the aluminum windows and doors more palatable or, or not? Because we are flexible on the color, honestly.

Mr. Ball: I mean, maybe if those are painted to match that, that interior blue, right, then it kind of pulls it all together, right. Instead of having this blue vestibule and then everything else is black with the aluminum. I don't know. Maybe that's too much, right. It's too much for it's like all these little, all this white is now that bluish color.

Ms. Hiraga: Scott?

Mr. Forsythe: If I may jump in here for a second?

Mr. Ball: Yeah.

Mr. Forsythe: I'd just like to add a couple of things to consider and part of the reason why some of this is coming to you is the design guidelines state, you know, is to retain Wailuku so it does become something that's, you know, traditionally it wasn't as far as appearance goes. And so there is flexibility. The guidelines provide recommendations so it's not a requirement. And I'm asking for clarification on some of these items. That's why it's within the discussion. So that's one thing I wanted to bring up about the design guidelines.

Colors also has been coming up quite a bit here in the discussion. And within the analysis there is a review of colors and maybe this will help kind guide the decision here. And the colors are on page-13 of the report. And what it says within the guidelines on page-43 is stucco was traditionally used only on the building's main façade and wrapped around a few feet onto the side walls. And then you down further down. Number five, the appropriate

colors should be used for various types of construction. Stucco construction should be beige like earth tones, pale pastels are typical. And so these are the guidelines. It's not a requirement, but this is what the guidelines are saying that traditionally these buildings have this type of color.

Mr. Ball: Well, we're far away from that with color on the rendering. Those don't look -- it doesn't look beige to me or light earth tones. I mean, whatever it is I mean.

Ms. Hiraga: And also number-six, a building's color scheme should be compatible with those of adjacent buildings. The very point that I brought up.

Ms. Wright: We are --. You know, we want to fit in the community. We're part of this community. We've been, MAPA has been around for 50-years. And, and the idea of taking a bold choice with color was something that we wanted to explore. If, if you determine that that's too bold for Wailuku, we are definitely open to shifting the color. You know, we, we went through a lot of different colors before we, before we got to this one and we could easily go back to one of our more pastel ones. And I do, I kind of love the idea that it, that it would fit into the Wailuku atmosphere. And then it's when you go inside, when you get to that vestibule, there's the little surprise. And then you, and then you get inside and it's, it's this magical place where stories come to life. And so we're definitely open to that.

Mr. Ball: I mean, even if there was some lighter accent colors maybe on there. It just seems like this big black canvas, right, black canvas there, sitting there waiting to be drawn on, you know what I mean?

Ms. Wright? Yeah. I mean, it's sort of a nod to, you know, like the black curtains in the back of it, you know.

Mr. Ball: Yeah. No, and I get the, I get the whole theatrical concept. Everything is cool, but I think it might just be a little too much. I mean, maybe half and half it or something. I don't know. It's, it's difficult.

Mr. Teague: I do --

Mr. Ball: Go ahead.

Mr. Teague: Yeah, when you say half and half it, I think that maybe the community is --. Like, if something that would be to the Commission it going to be -- I save our bang for the vestibule and let that kind of be like --. You know, if, if the, if the, if the primary facade color is something, you know, a little bit more attuned to the, the, the design guideline prescription. If we have perhaps a little bit of flexibility at just the vestibule, which is technically, you know, it's kind of this interior exterior sort of space. Does that seem like something -- and maybe it's hard to speak in abstract terms, you'd probably want to see it,

right. But what does that sound like something that might be a good, a good kind of middle ground, kind of like a half and half, sort of like, you know, proposal?

Mr. Ball: Yeah, I would say so.

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah.

Mr. Ball: Yeah. Commissioners?

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah I would, I would welcome the opportunity for you to present maybe a different palette that you think could work, you know.

Ms. Wright: Okay. That's easy. We've got lots of that. The Baby Seal Black is, is -- the way we kind of stumbled into that was looking at the Calvary Church because I was . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Ball: I was just, I just bringing, was going to bring that up, right.

Ms. Wright: Yeah.

Mr. Ball: The Calvary Church's color are dark, but they're not so big, right?

Ms. Wright: Yeah.

Mr. Teague: . . . (inaudible) . . . not so stark maybe.

Mr. Ball: Yeah, not so stark.

Ms. Wright: Yeah. Okay.

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah. If you don't mind. Appreciate it.

Ms. Wright: No problem. How does it work, like, do you -- in terms of this process. Do, do you give your sort of approval of the other aspects of it except the color. And then we come back to you with new colors or --?

Mr. Ball: Yeah, we probably just go down these and then you'll hear the comments, right?

Ms. Wright: Okay.

Mr. Ball: Go ahead Scott.

Mr. Forsythe: Okay.

Mr. Ball: We'll try to get out of here by 6:00 tonight.

Mr. Forsythe: We're getting closer, maybe. Okay, so -- all right, so this next two have to deal with the, the entrance way. So number three, is it appropriate to reposition the front doors off center in the entryway? And this goes back to the plans on how the existing entryway or door is centered with the building alignment going straight up. And with the proposed project itself off center to the right in order to meet the ADA grade requirements to get into the building by moving the front door closer to the sidewalk. And so -- so the question is, is it appropriate to reposition the front doors off center in the entryway?

Ms. Hiraga: I don't have a concern with that.

Mr. Ball: Go ahead Gwen.

Ms. Hiraga: I think it's fine.

Mr. Ball: I was going to say the same thing, except, you know, there's a little bit of --. What's the height on that difference between that kind of pop out area and the sidewalk, right. There's a little --

Mr. Teague: Like a little step?

Mr. Ball: Yeah, a little step, if you will.

Mr. Teague: Yeah, it ends up being about a four, I believe it's a four inch height at the, at the end of it. And where we have -- and didn't draw this -- the idea there was that potentially we would have some sort of either a planter box or there would be something sculptural there to avoid. It wouldn't be, it wouldn't be a primary kind of like a walkway. But it would be, it'd be something that we blocked to avoid any kind of trip hazards or anything like that.

Mr. Ball: And I think that pop out will help that too, right, because it's not like I'm looking for an entering here, right. It's kind of guide into the side, so, yeah, that'll help for sure. George, you got any comments on those?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: No. I agree. I was concerned about that one step. But with pop out, with that facade, if you want to call it that, up front, think it will go.

Mr. Ball: Good. Scott, carry on.

Mr. Forsythe: Okay. And I did, I did skip one item number two. It was back to the aluminum frames in which it was stated that, no, the aluminum frames are not appropriate for the windows. Number two is in regards to the aluminum frames for the doors if they are

appropriate. And the same information applies to that as well that I had previously brought up.

Ms. Hiraga: And so my comment would be the same. You know, I do have a concern with the aluminum frame, the glass doors.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: So, nothing further from me on that.

Mr. Teague: Really quickly, I'm sorry to interject. I see that my battery on, on my tablet is dying. I'm going to switch over to my laptop. So if, if I -- if you lose me, I'll be right back, okay.

Mr. Ball: Okay. Thank you.

Mr. Teague: Sorry. Thank you.

Mr. Ball: No worries. Okay, so maybe there's an alternative solution for that...to those doors too.

Mr. Teague: I do think that whatever we do with the windows, we probably do that with the door too just to keep that kind of a uniform system.

Ms. Hiraga: Very good idea.

Ms. Wade: . . . (inaudible) . . . jump in and answer your question real quick?

Mr. Ball: Go ahead Erin. So you get on the phone. Are you phoning a friend for this question?

Ms. Wade: I am. So I wondered because I know Carolyn folks have lots of money sources that are tied to timelines. So I just wanted to check what you're asking for today, does any of this fire a decision like an official decision making or are you able to come back to the . . . (inaudible) . . .?

Mr. Ball: Are you talking to us, Erin?

Ms. Wade: Yes, I was.

Mr. Ball: Oh. Your mic just keeps popping in and out so --

Ms. Wade: Can you hear me now?

Mr. Ball: Yeah.

Ms. Wade: Kind of?

Mr. Ball: Yeah.

Ms. Wade: Okay. So Carolyn . . . (inaudible) . . . approval today on any of this, or directions today, or can you come back to us based on your funders?

Ms. Wright: Is that a question for me, Erin, about whether or not the funders need a, need an answer today?

Ms. Wade: Yes.

Ms. Wright: Well, we do have quite a lot of funding that is time sensitive. So it would be wonderful to know what direction you expect us to go in. And if we need to make any changes like color or changing out the windows from aluminum to wood, that sort of thing, I don't know what the time frame is like in terms of coming back to you. Can we, can we do a quick little visit again in January to --

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah.

Ms. Wright: Yeah. Okay. That's . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. Hiraga: . . . (inaudible) . . . Erin?

Ms. Wright: Okay, well, if we can come back to in January, that's, that's fine for us. Sooner is always better. But I know you only meet once a month so that's perfect. That'll be fine. Yeah.

Mr. Teague: Yeah. I think what would be helpful for us too is like the extent we can get any of, you know, the five or six items that are that were questions particularly for you guys tonight, to the extent we can get any definitive yeses on things that are approved. So we just know how we can limit our next round of study and tailor it to, to what is still open question that would be super helpful.

Mr. Ball: Go ahead, Scott.

Mr. Forsythe: Okay, so let's go to number four and this has to deal with the vestibules, and the proposed angles within the vestibules. Walking into the vestibule, you see that the proposal is to curve the corners. And there were examples provided within the presentation about various curves within the architecture within the town. However, I will note that those representations all were more curves within either the, the parapet area or an archway. And

then most of the corner edges of the buildings within Wailuku are at angles, not curves. And so the question is, is it appropriate to modify the vestibules so that the corners are curved?

Mr. Ball: I'm looking at Exhibit A.23. Is that what we're talking about right now?

Mr. Forsythe: Correct. And it's also shown on one of the front elevations too. A little bit on a A.31. But it's a little darker on that one, on that print out. That's correct. That's it. So if you look at the site plan that is on Exhibit A.23 you can see how it is curved when it comes. I'm sorry, not curve, angled. And when it moves forward, the angles in the vestibule will be curved.

Mr. Ball: Commissioners, anything? Gwen? George?

Mr. Hiraga: I'm okay with that.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: I have nothing.

Mr. Ball: Yeah. Me too.

Mr. Forsythe: I believe that . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Ball: Yeah. It seems to be okay.

Mr. Forsythe: And if you're ready, we'll go to number five here, which has in regards to the sidewalk emblem. And because of the lengthy discussion on this and there's also been discussion about what's historic and what isn't historic. And this item we're looking for a determination on and it's not necessarily from what is called historic or not. It's more of one of those traditional things within Wailuku that is nostalgic that brings people back to Wailuku from what it once was. And is it appropriate to eliminate something like this from the town's character. And the question is, is it appropriate to remove the Dollar emblem from the sidewalk?

Mr. Ball: I mean, I'm with George. I would like to see it stay there. But if it can't, because of the ADA part of it, I mean, kind of a rock and a hard place at that point, right?

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah. I feel the same way, Keone.

Mr. Ball: But it would be nice like we discussed to have some sort of, like, history of the building, right, on some random wall in the bathroom or something. That's really history, right. I mean, this memory, everybody remembers this symbol on the ground, right. And people like, oh, yeah, right.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: That's, that's why I mentioned earlier that I kind of, it kind of kept me going, that it wasn't even mentioned other than the destroying of it. So I'm just wondering, again, how much detail was done, and is it a cost factor, is it unrealistic? But we don't know that because you just mentioned.

Ms. Wright: Do you feel like you have all the information you need now from us now or --?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: No. Because there's nothing is what you guys did to try and save it, or what is the cost. It just said that to meet the ADA requirements it will be removed. So it's kind of an open area.

Ms. Wright: Okay. I mean, we could give you more information about how the engineer looked at the grading and how the ADA requirement had to be met.

Mr. Ball: Right. And I guess --

Ms. Wright: And how that cuts off the left side of -- you can see it in one of the pictures it would cut off the left side of it.

Mr. Ball: And I think, I think that's what we're looking for, right, the documentation of what we talked about in your report, right. That we tried to do this but because of these certain materials and this angle and this and that, you know, everything that we already discussed. If somebody looked at this would say, okay, they talked about that, right.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Yeah also in looking over this package that was sent, I see a letter to, to them from 2007. And in that letter, it's said they talk about doors and windows, frame and wood. So I'm wondering if the 2007 request from, from the Department, from Jeffrey Hunt, the planning Director, was it ever looked at to go into the new section that -- the new innovation? Because I'm looking at a letter that, again, stated that it was for renovations to the building in 2007 and that was part of it. And in there it said about doors and windows. And I don't see how we, we are saying that aluminum is the only thing. And that other letter said if couldn't do it, you have a substitute or a make it look like wood. But I don't see anything that you guys put in this time that covers that. It just said your guys going use aluminum.

Ms. Wright: Yeah. I'll have to find out about that, about what happened in 2007. I know that that renovation didn't involve the doors and the windows on the street level. It only involved putting those little decorative things up at the top and those two windows that are vertical. So I can get more information about that. I was -- I worked for MAPA at the time, but as a teacher. So I wasn't in the administrative side of things, so I don't know. But I can get more information about that.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Because it says specifically in here, and I'm reading from the letter, wood and glass doors shall be used for the entryway. So it's already even though the renovations that you're saying wasn't part of it, for the doors, but it already said that wood and glass doors to be used for the entryway.

Ms. Wright: Okay.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: And that was in 2007.

Ms. Wright: Yeah. And I have no, I think I have no problem. I mean, Kevin would have to weigh in here as the architect, but moving to wooden doors and windows, even, I mean, we'll have to raise a little more money, you know, but that's okay. We're happy to put in the wooden doors and windows, if that's what you guys determine is the appropriate thing. And especially going back to that letter that you're referring to George, that that's no problem.

I do have a question about documenting the work that we did on the Dollar sign emblem. What form would that come in? Is it a letter that we write to the MRA as an addendum to this presentation or what -- how does that work?

Mr. Ball: I think Scott can help you with that.

Ms. Wright: Okay. Okay. Perfect. All right.

Mr. Forsythe: Okay, so those -- that's the end of the recommendation and determination portion of the report. And moving into the conclusion section, we'll defer that until January when we have the revised information of plans, and take another look at this, if that's the correct approach.

Mr. Ball: Yeah.

Mr. Teague: Can I ask just one last question? Sorry, I didn't realize I was muted there and with no video. I was there for all that. So I just a quick question for you. When it comes to wood windows, I'm presuming that most of the wood windows that exist throughout Wailuku are in fact painted. If instead, I'm wondering, because it's probably mostly an aesthetic question, right. Like whether or not you want to see the aluminum metal. But as far as the Commission is concerned, if we ended up doing like a painted, meaning a non-metal aluminum window, would that be something you would consider? I'm just thinking to cost some of the efficiencies in metal windows versus, versus wood. Is that something that you would, that you would consider, and if we showed you that as part of a next palette, would that be would that be palatable to you or is it just that they just have to be wood for the sake of being wood? Is it more the aesthetic or just, you know --?

Mr. Ball: For me, it would be aesthetic.

Mr. Teague: I think we can, we can achieve it in wood. Or excuse me, achieve it in metal, if it's painted.

Mr. Ball: For me, it's aesthetics because it's more of the look, right, the drive-by look. It's not going right up to it, right, and looking at it. Because you know, those aluminum ones that are out there, right. You know, the existing now are probably pretty crummy, probably from the 70s or earlier. So that might be a solution, right, for me. I don't know. What do you guys think, Gwen, George?

Ms. Hiraga: Yeah, I think Kevin, if you don't mind, at least presenting that as an option.

Mr. Teague: We'd be happy to do.

Mr. Ball: Okay. Thank you. Okay, so I guess at this point we'll defer this to the January 28th meeting. We'll put that on our agenda and then you should have it all figured out by then.

Ms. Wright: Thank you everybody. We appreciate . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Teague: I will do that.

Ms. Wright: . . . (inaudible) . . . and your help with everything and making this project happen.

Mr. Ball: Yeah, no thank you guys. I'm excited to see that in Wailuku for sure.

Mr. Teague: Very good. Well, nice, nice meeting all of you. Erin, nice to see you as always. Scott, same to you. And I look forward to working with you guys, getting this, getting this guy, getting it built. Really exciting.

Ms. Wright: Thank you. Happy holidays, everybody.

Mr. Ball: Take care and thank you.

Ms. Wright: Bye.

Ms. Hiraga: Bye.

Mr. Teague: Thank you.

The applicant presented the above referenced project. However, the Agency requested additional information. Therefore, without any objections, the Agency deferred the application to the January 28, 2022 meeting in order for the applicant to gather and provide the Agency with additional information as requested.

D. OLD BUSINESS

Without objections by the Agency, Agenda Item D.1. was taken up before Agenda Items D.2. and D.3.

3. Information on the new PARK MAUI program and upcoming community outreach efforts.

Mr. Ball: Okay, let's go back now to Item B, New Business. No, sorry. Yes.

Ms. Wade: D, Old Business.

Mr. Ball: Let me look at the agenda. So we're going to old business. Yeah, Erin.

Ms. Wade: Can you hear me? It's item three.

Mr. Ball: Item three, information on Park Maui?

Ms. Wade: That's the one.

Mr. Ball: Okay. Item three. Information on Park, the new Park Maui program upcoming community outreach efforts. We have a power point presentation.

Ms. Wade: Yes. So on the call is Julie Dixon, our consultant, and she is going to kind of share with you where we are.

Ms. Julie Dixon: Can you hear me okay?

Mr. Ball: Yep.

Ms. Dixon: Ah, great. Thank you so much. I know Erin's going to share her screen and be my guide as it relates to the power point slides. So hopefully Erin can get those up on the screen. Nice to see all of you. Again, my name is Julie Dixon. And we're very happy to be here today to basically provide a progress report on parking management for the County of Maui. We have been using the term Park Maui which we think is a really great approach towards talking about this project because it really does encompass many details associated with this particular project. And we've actually been working with a graphic designer who's actually created this emblem. And you'll hopefully see this thematically, basically pulled throughout this presentation. And I'm actually happy to report I was just in Maui, just last week, and I was excited to see the progress with the Wailuku garage and being able to just visit and see all of the locations for some of the things that we're going to talk about here next.

So as we move to the next slide. We've actually been working on this project now for several years. And I recognize some very familiar faces from previous meetings. And everything that goes into this project has very much been what I like to call stakeholder driven in speaking with you all at past meetings or also going out and speaking to the community. All of that has been interwoven into something that we call a parking action plan. And now we're into the efforts of what it takes to start to implement or deploy the parking action plan. There's been a lot of behind the scenes work that have been going on for the last several months, including really getting organized. And what I mean by that is getting some exposure to some of the different technology providers that are out there in the industry so that staff can start to familiarize themselves with basically what would be the onus or the burden associated with a project like this. We've also been steadily working on the County Codes, which I'll mention here in a moment during this presentation. And I already mentioned the brand, which you'll see interwoven throughout this process.

Now, one of the reasons why we're here today is because the work that we've been doing behind the scenes is now starting to come to the forefront. And we're anticipating that we will have a couple of solicitations that will hit the street and be published. Our hope is this month, if not early in the new year, that we'll begin to solicit some of the operational details that are going to be required or what I like to call the foundational bricks of the program. Some of that is relating to the technology that we'll need in the garage, as well as, as we start to talk about parking management deployments throughout Maui and being able to set ourselves up so that we can have a very consistent and user friendly program that's very customer service driven.

And if we can go to the next slide, I'll just talk a little bit about some of those details. I know that you all have already had a very full meeting, and I want to make sure to be very effective with our time. And so without going into all of the line items, I just want to highlight the fact that when you see the schedule of kind of where we are right now versus where we are going. Basically the solicitations, or RFPs, that we're going to be publishing are really about, again, those foundational building blocks. And then that's really when we're looking at early next year when we really start going back out into the communities utilizing this brand, and to start to talk about how this program would basically be relevant within the different towns, how it would work for our residents, and all of the bells and whistles that basically come along with those programs.

One of the things that I always like to say, as we go to the next slide, is that parking needs to be as transparent as possible. We want everyone to know about this program because what we're really seeking is compliance. We want people to follow the rules. And so as much education and outreach as we can have is going to be key. And so as a result of that, a lot of that behind the scenes work that's been getting done is really trying to figure out where parking management is going to live within the County structure. And one of the things that we have deemed at this point, and you'll see this in an upcoming slide, is that

there will be many departments that will be involved in this program. But it is our hope that the Department of Transportation will actually be what I will call the coordinators of the overall program. And so we've been working on a job description in hopes of hiring that parking coordinator role as the program rolls out. Now, mind you, this might not be a job that's needed on day one, but it is a role that will be really important when we talk about the additional services or responsibilities associated with the different departments. And also, when I mentioned all of the different solicitations that we're going to be running, it's really important that we have oversight of those agreements, and making sure that we do have vendors and operators that are being held accountable and operating to the standards established by the County. And so that's going to be really important because while technology can introduce as much efficiency as we possibly could think of, the fact is, is that there still requires oversight and assurances to make sure that everything is meeting the standards and expectations of our community. Next slide.

And so one of the things that's also been talked quite a bit about is, okay, well, what about all this money that we're going to make? I want to highlight the fact that when we talk about parking management, we always talk about developing a sustainable solution. And that's always the number one priority when we talk about parking management is making sure that we define the objectives of the program. And that could be achieving turnover in parking spaces. It could be providing residents free parking locations or priority parking locations. Most importantly, when we talk about the signage, the education, the technology, we need to be sure that the program pays for itself. And then the intention is, is to be able to set up a parking revenue revolving fund that not only sustains the program and also has a set aside for preventative maintenance and long-term upkeep, but then also to be able to have categories defined where any surplus monies can be allocated. And that can be within the different towns, location base, to be able to implement improvements in lighting, improvements in sidewalks, you name it. And I think that that's what's really neat is the opportunity for these programs to be able to give back.

Now, one of the things I always like to say is that when it comes to the revenue side of things, I just like to say to folks, don't start cashing checks until the program is live and operational. We are very optimistic. And based on the forecasting that we've done, that there will be surplus monies associated with this program. But I always like to say let's get the program live and operational and making sure that it's meeting all of the needs before we start spending the money. So we do want to structure this in a way so that we can have a revenue revolving fund so that those specialty programs can receive those resources. Next slide.

And so the Code updates. This is probably one of the more heavier lifts of the project, and it's really because we like to use the term future proofing the County Code. We've actually been working with staff and legal and going through the different recommendations associated with this. It will have to go through the appropriate public hearings to make these updates, but it basically will allow and accommodate for the changes that we're anticipating

coming when it comes to a parking management. As well as allowing for the ability to have parking ambassadors and having folks out there being able to provide that compliance support, as well as defining those departmental structures that I mentioned where in this case, the Department of Transportation being able to manage parking. Next slide.

And so as we go to the next slide, hopefully. There we go. Thank you, Erin. I mentioned the procurements and I'm happy to answer any questions about this, but I know you've already had a full agenda. But what this really basically means is the tools and pieces that the County staff will use to manage the program, but also the front facing infrastructure that our community members as well as our visitors would basically utilize. In some cases, it could be a mobile payment device. It could be a pay station. But also very importantly, it could be the signage that's branded and identified to make it convenient and easy for anybody parking in any of the designated locations. Next slide.

And as we go to the next slide, you'll see that there's a couple of pieces of feedback that we've been seeking. And if there's time and it will allow for it today, we would love to hear about your ideas of potentially where the pilot locations should initiate, any of the priorities associated with revenue, any concerns about the roles and responsibilities that I've described here today. But as I go through, I'll go ahead and we'll come back to that if it's okay. So I'll run through the rest of the slides if it's appropriate, Erin, thank you.

So I believe that going through the rest of these slides, I think if you jump down just a handful, maybe we get down to our goals slide. Yeah, one more. Perfect. I think that one of the things that I usually like to start the discussion on is to really, I'll say really kind of close on this particular slide because I think we have two power points that are kind of bundled together here. But in this particular case, when we talk about the goals and objectives of the program, we do want to make sure that this is a very customer service oriented program for the County. We want to make sure that we're addressing the demand impacts especially within our different towns, and in our parks, and at our beaches. We want to make sure that we're creating opportunities for our locals and our community members to be able to access those congested areas. And we really want to minimize the negative impacts of parking on our residents. And that is actually one of the purposes of our most recent visit, is being able to go through the different impacted locations to be able to identify how we can ensure that that accessibility is retained and ensure that it's not infringed upon and that those resources are not only protected but available for our community members. And most importantly, being able to really bring that best in class solution to Maui is really important. And making sure that we're really leveraging our community values. And making sure, again, that protection of our local resources is something that, from our first visit to the island, it's something that I can really appreciate the importance of that. And I will tell you, I was very much listening in on a previous discussion and recognize the importance and value of where you all live. And I think that that's something that's important. I always like to identify. I do not live in Maui and it's something that my job is to try to ensure that we have a solution that works for all of you. And as I see Erin's kind of scrolling through the rest of the slides, I

think that that really encapsulates pretty much everything that's combined in both of those slides. Erin, was there anything else you wanted me to be sure to cover today? Do you want me to talk about the . . . (inaudible) . . . parking one?

Ms. Wade: Sure.

Ms. Dixon: So there's a couple of codes that will be really important. And I'll use Lahaina as a good example. And honestly, Wailuku is one as well. We have posted time limits in both of those communities. And what has happened traditionally because our police officers currently provide the parking enforcement services, people figure out pretty quick that our police resources are basically prioritizing public safety, which I would hope that they would do. And so people tend to abuse the posted time limits as they are posted, and they tend to park for all day. And so one of the rules that we think are going to be really important, and this has worked very well in impacted communities just like yours, is introducing what we call a no re-parking ordinance.

And basically what that means is if there's a three hour posted time limit or a two hour posted time limit, whatever the rules may be, you basically can park for your two hours, but then after that, you can't park on that block face again, basically until the next two hours or the next three hours. And I will say to you that this is one of the simplest rules that we've been able to utilize in other communities that have been the most effective. And there's lots of tools that we'll use to leverage to help manage this particular issue. One of which that's very popular is the use of license plate recognition technology because basically it can geo position the cars and make us very efficient in the field. But this is something that we think is really important so that we can encourage people that do want to stay all day, especially in some of our locations, is a park in those locations where they should. Like in the Prison Street lot, for example, or in one of our dedicated locations that are identified for long term parking. And to leave the most premium parking available for our customers, or our locals, or somebody that needs to come run down and grab a cup of coffee or whatever the case may be. And so we think that this is one of those codes that really can have a big impact in the long term.

And, you know, the nice thing I should, I should have also mentioned when I talk about tools and technology, our parking compliance staff, or what we like to call our parking ambassadors, are not only are they the eyes and ears for our community members, but they also can provide warning notices. And this is something that will be really important as we talk about that transparency and implementing a new program. When we find vehicles that have never had a citation before, for example, we can have the option to issue a warning notice as an education tool. This is something that's really leveraged in the first several weeks, if not months, of a program to be able to help make sure that that community outreach and messaging is occurring. Now, I want to be mindful of the fact that we do have a lot of rental cars, understandably, in and around Maui, and that's something that will obviously be taken into consideration.

There's something also, as we talk about the Free Locals Program, is that we've been really cognizant of ways that we can try to make it easy for residents to be able to participate in that program and not require necessarily a decal or a hang tag on their cars. And that's why when we talk about license plate driven solutions. It's one of the things that we're anticipating being a big part of the program. And there on the screen you actually see that example of a parking ambassador. And also importantly, when we talk about our impacted communities, having an employee designated parking permit, this includes for the county campus, but having those locations so that we can ensure that we're also protecting our neighborhoods. And making sure that we don't have spill over into the residential areas. And making sure that we're making it so that our people that are supporting our communities by working there have a safe and accessible location to park as well.

Anything else we got on there, Erin? I think that last one. Perfect. So this was the one I mentioned about the structure in terms of the Department of Transportation. I have to tell you, there is almost every department in the County in some way, shape or form tends to play a role in parking at this point. And I don't anticipate that that's necessarily changing because there is different important factors and responsibilities that tie into each of those departments. But that's where we're anticipating the Department of Transportation to be able to play that oversight role. And we have been communicating with all of these departments and actively involved kind of every step of the way.

So with that, I think we're at the end of the presentation and wanted to turn the floor over to all of you and see if anyone had any thoughts about some of the questions that I posed or just general reactions to what we've talked about here. today.

Mr. Ball: Well, I'm hoping that most of the --. I'm glad you're looking at all those different things. One being the long term parking that kind of foreseen, if you will, people to park in the long term parking instead of on the Market, and you know, the few that are on Vineyard left or whatever. And then the, the not charging local either. That's one of the most frustrating things when you go to the West Side is then you have to pay for parking in some parking lot that you know is making hand over fist because they keep charging everybody for these ghost stalls and all that other kind of stuff. But anyway, so I'm glad to hear that those are -- and, you know, parking ambassadors and, you know, people have to learn. And the one thing I don't want to see is like, you know, you go to some places and there's just like sign after sign after sign after signing. And it's kind of like, wait, which one do I got to pick today, right, kind of thing. So anything else, guys?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Yeah, I do.

Mr. Ball: Yeah, George.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Being a former police officer, you talk to a point that I'm afraid of; that video camera on the license plate. Who gets that? Because our State law very specifically says only law enforcement personnel or qualified people. The last time they went into a camera system on Oahu, they went out to a private agency. They had all kinds of problem. That is a big concern for me.

Ms. Dixon: It's a great point. And I will tell you that that is the top topic when it does come down to license plate based solutions. And I want to provide you the assurance that on the license plate recognition technology, there is no license plate look-up back to basically the Department of Motor Vehicles. There is a permit registration database for the folks that participate and register their license plates. And that is basically what it's comparing it up against. And so I will tell you that California probably has the strictest rules of any state in the union right now when it relates to license plate recognition technology. And we have been replicating those regulations and ordinances, especially associated with data security in every state that we work in. And so I can appreciate that sensitivity and can assure you of the fact that that's at the very top of the list when we talk about security concerns. But the fact is, is that the parking enforcement personnel and parking staff do not have DMV look-up capabilities at all, and that license plate recognition is only working against the database in support of the parking program. But I hear you loud and clear.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Yeah, but the concern I have is that the information that you have from the customer to put on your database it gives private information as to where they live and all these other stuff and phone numbers. That should be privileged information.

Ms. Dixon: And that's something that we write into all of those solicitations that I mentioned. There's very strict requirements on what data can be used for. In fact, for only this program and this purpose, the program data cannot be resold or used for marketing. The only time that that would ever be the case is if a user elected to participate in that program. And I'll use the example of for mobile payment, like if there's companies that are very popular, like park mobile or pay by phone, when you as a customer sign up for those programs, there's a little check mark that says you can opt in to receive information about discounts on parking or special programs or vendors that are participating. And that can become a customer choice to be able to opt into those programs. But otherwise, when we put those types of restrictions in, they're not allowed to even ask for that permission in most cases. But I will say that's the some -- that happens in some cities where they allow those vendors that privilege. But I will tell you that locking that down is very easy to do. And I can tell you with the programs that I have been involved in, there have not been any instances of these types of breaches where we've had any of those challenges. Like ten years ago, before a lot of the data security issues were in place, I wouldn't be able to make statements like that. But I can tell you today I'm very comfortable and confident with the data security requirements to ensure the data for the County as well.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: I don't think you're talking about the data. But we are talking of individuals in that could be involved in that. How do we certify, or create, or feel comfortable with individuals?

Ms. Dixon: And when you see individuals, meaning the, the, the employees of the companies that support those programs?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Yes.

Ms. Dixon: So I will tell you that for programs like this, especially when parking citations are involved, there are certain requirements by State when it comes to certain forms that you have to sign. For example, in California, if I am going to work with a city that does have DMV access to send notices on parking citations, I have to sign those papers to acknowledge the rules, the security requirements, and basically, you know, any of that information that I have access to and what it can be used for. And if for some reason I violated those, I can be criminally prosecuted. So I do have to highlight the fact that just like any program, just like any person that worked in the records department, at the police department, you know, you kind of sign all of those acknowledgments. And if somebody is going to be a bad guy, it's going to end up having to go after them legally. But I will tell you that in that instance of what you're describing, I have not had that experience.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Okay. I'm really grateful for that. But coming from the police department, we've had people in the police department they get arrested criminally. So there's no guarantees, and yet I would even venture to say that they, that they would have to go back and double check. So I'm just --. Excuse me, but I'm really concerned about those type of information that can get out.

Ms. Dixon: It's a valid concern and I can tell you that all we can do is be as stringent as possible and to ensure that we have the oversight. And that's why I mentioned the fact that this while technology is amazing, you still have to provide oversight. You still have to check the checks and balances and make sure everything's working the way that it's supposed to. I would love to tell you that you can just turn the program on and walk away from it, but that's not a reality of a program like this that has such a high touch point. And that would basically involve everybody that basically works, lives, and visits all around the county.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Thank you. I appreciate it.

Mr. Ball: Gwen, you got anything?

Ms. Hiraga: No, I don't. Thank you.

Mr. Ball: I have one follow up on George's. Is it an opt in or is it an opt out choice?

Ms. Dixon: Great question. So you meant like if you wanted to be -- to get the discounts on your mobile app account type of thing?

Mr. Ball: Right.

Ms. Dixon: So it's one of those features that when we solicit that vendor, we can mandate whether or not that's even allowed or not. The reason why it's an important one is because when you start involving your merchants and I'll use Lahaina as an example, your merchants can basically participate in the program and provide validations for parking and little bells, whistles and things like that. And so typically it's an opt in, because I know as a, as a person that has a mobile phone, I don't want all of the excess notices and text messages. So I appreciate that I have to choose to receive those notices. And that could be something that can be configurable and something that, you know, as we move through the process, can be determined on how, and if that's even a feature, and if it is a feature, how you want it to be configured. It can go either way, but it's really up to the County.

Mr. Ball: Okay. And then are you guys in charge of, like, promotional for this, like videos on TV about, you know, how to get in the place and how to get out of the place, right, those whole things. And --

Ms. Dixon: It's, it's --

Mr. Ball: -- education component, I guess.

Ms. Dixon: All, all of the above. I will tell you that I'm grateful to be here today to talk to you all about this because my hope is in 2022, eventually you're going to get, like, Park Maui, like I've heard enough, I've heard enough. That's a good thing. And that's where I think we're going to leverage every avenue that we possibly can to help message the program. And it's really going to start with the community members so that we can really get out there and talk to the different towns and neighborhoods, the commercial districts, and really get the word out there first. And then we start to really talk about kind of the mass -- I hate to use the word mass marketing, but the truth is this is going to be something that we need to be sure, you know, dots all the I's and cross all the T's. Honestly, even as I was coming in and out of the airport, I was already envisioning the messaging on a little trolley to the rental car shuttle. And that messaging starts there. You know when people are renting their vehicles, signing up for their reservations, the messaging starts at that point as well as carries through to when you're in and around the island without, without creating blight. I think that's the key, is that if we can provide so much online or promotional materials, it's going to help streamline the noticing in the different communities. And that's something I want to --. In fact, it's that balance of making sure that you get the message out there so that people understand the rules, but not also having to have a sign every ten feet. So I think that that's where finding that sweet spot is going to be very critical.

Mr. Ball: Okay. Anybody else?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: No. I'm good.

Mr. Ball: Okay, thank you, Julie, for coming in and updating us on Park Maui.

Ms. Dixon: Have a good holiday season, everybody. I appreciate it.

1. **Discussion on additional recommended changes to the Wailuku Redevelopment Area Zoning and Development Code, for future Title 19 updates.**
2. **Discussion regarding [the roles and responsibilities of the MRA](#), the status of the Wailuku Redevelopment Plan, and the changing and on-going needs of the district. Discussion with members intended to open a dialog about the MRA in its current form, with the ability to provide a recommendation to the Department regarding the future of the board.**

Mr. Ball: You too. Thank you. Okay, are we at department updates now, Erin?

Ms. Wade: . . . (inaudible) . . . George has to leave at 2:30 p.m., and we're about to lose Mike Hopper as well. He has to go to Council. So I would recommend deferral of the other two items.

Mr. Ball: Yeah. Any objection to deferring the other items, Gwen or George?

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: No.

Mr. Ball: Okay, let's defer those to January 28th meeting.

Without objections by the Agency, Agenda Items D.1. and D.2. were deferred.

E. DEPARTMENT UPDATES

1. **Church and Vineyard Street Improvement Project Status**
2. **Wailuku Parking Structure Update**
3. **Business Interruption/Rental Assistance**
4. **Small Town Big Art updates**

5. Upcoming agenda items

Ms. Wade: Okay. Great. And then I don't have any substantial updates or . . . (inaudible) . . . I kind of keep these standing.

F. NEXT MEETING: January 28, 2022

G. ADJOURNMENT

Mr. Ball: Okay. All right. Well, if nothing else, the next meeting will be January 28th, one o'clock, still -- we're still Zooming right in the New Year or BlueJeans-ing I should say.

All right. Well, Merry Christmas, Happy holidays to everybody out there. Have a safe holiday.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Same to all of you. Enjoy the holidays.

Ms. Hiraga: Same to all of you. Bye.

Mr. Ball: See you in the new year.

Mr. Kaho'ohanohano: Bye.

Mr. Ball: Meeting adjourned at 3:12 p.m.

There being no further discussion brought before the Agency, the meeting was adjourned at 3:12 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

LEILANI A. RAMORAN-QUEMADO
Secretary of Boards and Commissions II

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE

PRESENT:

Keone Ball, Vice-Chair

Gwen Hiraga

George Kaho'ohanohano

EXCUSED:

Jo-Ann Ridao

OTHERS:

Erin Wade, Maui Redevelopment Program Planner, Department of Management
Scott Forsythe, Small Town Planner, Planning Department
Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel