

**LANA'I PLANNING COMMISSION
SITE INSPECTION
MARCH 20, 2019**

A. CALL TO ORDER

The site inspection of the Lanai Planning Commission (Commission) assembled at approximately 3:00 p.m., Wednesday, March 20, 2019, at the Lanai Senior Center, Lanai City, Hawaii.

A quorum of the Commission was present (see Record of Attendance).

B. SITE INSPECTION

LANAI RESORTS, LLC, doing business as PŪLAMA LĀNA'I requesting a Project District Phase 2 Development Approval and County Special Use Permit for construction and operation of an Adventure Center including zip line facilities, recreational climbing courses, and a welcome center, at the former Experience at Koele Golf Course located on a portion (approximately 30 acres) of the 325.2-acre parcel of land identified by Tax Map Key (2) 4-9-018:003 (POR.), Koele, Lāna'i, Hawai'i (PH2 2018/0001) (CUP 2018/0001) (A. Cua for K. Wollenhaupt)

(The commission assembled at Site 1, the Koele Villas, at approximately 3:10 p.m.)

Ms. Lynn McCrory: Okay, thank you all for coming on the site visit for the adventure center. We're going to go to three places. The first one is the place where the sound recordings were taken. It's on the other side here, so we're going to walk over there and you can look down. And then those that are going to go up can go up. Those that cannot, cannot. Okay. So if you're ready follow me and try to stay close.

When you have your map, and we're talking about where the first readings were taken, no. 1, right here. That's it. Okay, so you can see we're still a distance away but that's where the sound meters were taken for one. This is Christian, and Christian is the acoustic engineer so I'll going to let him . . . (inaudible) . . . But, six was also marked and it's all the way up at the other end so there's a different level of sound transmitted down there. Okay? Okay, Christian.

Mr. Christian Thompson: So as Lynn mentioned this is the first place that we did measurements locations to where the Adventure Center will be to the residences. We actually set up a meter over there to record for the entire time that I was here. So it measured from about 10:30 in the morning till 4:30 in the evening, continuously, just measuring everything that came in.

Obviously there's no – they weren't scooping out muck out of the lake so it is not as loud as it is right now. To present the kind of worst case here to the closest to where everything is going to be. So this area has the potential to be the loudest from any of the Adventure Center elements that are proposed.

So we took measurements on a scale of every measurement. That way I could line up other measurements when I went to the other location. So Site 6 was a spot measurement that I took for 20 minutes to line up with the ones here so that way we could tell, okay, this is what the noise levels are like in this area throughout the day. And from the measurements at site 6 we could tell this what the measurements are like throughout the day further away from the site.

Mr. (____): So what noise were you actually measuring?

Mr. Thompson: What noise was I measuring? So it was just the ambient or back ground noise levels which is really the winds rustlings, the trees, birds, animals. Nature sounds, yeah.

Mr. (____): Wasn't there construction going work going on during that time also?

Mr. Thompson: There was some construction work going on, yes. There was nothing going on nearby here. And in fact, you couldn't even see any of the construction activities taking place. They were all out of sight. So the most you would get was trucks coming up and down.

Mr. (____): Tell me again why did you select Site 1 right here?

Mr. Thompson: Selected site 1 right here since --

Mr. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: Because it was the --. This represents the residential location.

Mr. (____): We live right here.

Mr. Thompson: Okay. So I measured at or near the property line because the way the Hawaii Administrative Rules are written . . . (inaudible) . . . at the property line. So I took the measurement there at the nearest property line to where the Adventure Center elements will be.

Mr. (____): So what do you expect the Site 1 to be exposed to?

Mr. Thompson: We expect Site 1, if you turn to the third page of your packet. We're looking at the purple line on that top graph. So that purple line is all of the Adventure Center elements operating all at one time. . . . (inaudible) . . . zip lines, there's 30 people on the adventure towers, and every single other smaller element is being used. And that predicted which is a little excessive, that's not anticipated to happen, to have all of those elements operating at such a high -- to have so many . . . (inaudible) . . . And that predicted value is 44 dba.

Mr. (____): How close will any of the elements be to Site 1?

Mr. Thompson: You might be able to answer that a little better. I think it was about 1,000 feet, 900 feet.

Ms. McCrory: You will be able to see sign as we go up to the various elements.

Ms. (____): The green line?

Ms. McCrory: Pardon? What do you want to know?

Mr. Thompson: The green line is the actual measured values from the meter that was up here.

Ms. (____): I thought I recalled something from the first meeting that there was going to be recording of the existing adventure center in Kapolei, and then played out here. Was that done?

Mr. Thompson: So I did perform measurements at the existing Adventure Center at Coral Crater, yes, and we used those values to predict the noise levels here.

Ms. (____): You didn't play anything here.

Ms. (____): Right, that was what I meant. I thought a recording was going to be made, extrapolate or whatever, and then brought here, and then played here.

Ms. McCrory: . . . (inaudible) . . . made of the sounds at the various other locations, and then it was played here.

Ms. (____): It wasn't played here.

Ms. (____): It was played here?

Ms. McCrory: Didn't you play it?

Mr. Thompson: We didn't, we didn't record any sound levels and put them into a speaker.

Ms. McCrory: You didn't. Okay.

Mr. Eric Marter: We used a set of software which is pretty amazing. Why don't you describe . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: Sure. So we used kind of a combination of spreadsheet analysis, and a computer model. The spreadsheet analysis on all the different locations that I went to measure, I measured activity, the zip line, the adventure tower, the team building element by themselves, and then I took another measurement nobody using that equipment. So that I could tell the exact noise level from that piece of -- that element only. I took those levels and

put them into our computer model. That takes into account the topographic data. We inputted the contour data directly into . . . (inaudible) . . . So we have all of the hills, all of the mountains, all the valleys encoded into it. It takes into account the distance, reflections like echoes, the foliage, the ground whether it absorbed it or not. It's pretty soft here so it is absorbent. It takes all of that into account, and predicts the noise . . . (inaudible) . . . In this case we compared it to the measurement points that we did the measurements at.

Mr. Green: What was difference between 1 and 6?

Mr. Thompson: The measured values between 1 and 6?

Mr. Green: Yes.

Mr. Thompson: It was about three to four decibels.

Ms. McCrory: Six was the bottom level.

Mr. Green: Only three or four?

Mr. Thompson: Correct.

Ms. McCrory: Yes.

Mr. Thompson: Yeah, Site 6 was very quiet.

Ms. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: So on, on --. That's the predicted value of everything, the actual measured values were about -- where it's the green line on the bottom here.

Mr. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: Okay, no problem. So it's about 58 to 48 was the measured values right there at Site 6. And up here, it was about 63 to 58, so about five.

Mr. (____): So this is --? Which one is the green one?

Mr. Thompson: The green one is the measured value. The orange is we . . . (inaudible) . . . here. And at Site 6 we measured noise levels when they were mowing the lawn on the golf course, so that's where that orange line is. The blue line is the limit according the Hawaii Administrative Rules. The green is what we actually measured. The purple is the predicted levels.

Ms. McCrory: Guys, it doesn't work if everyone's talking because no one is listening and that's the point of the site visit.

Mr. Thompson: So I'll back up a little bit. If you have your page open to both charts, just to make it a little more clearer for everyone just in case. The blue line is the Hawaii Administrative Rule noise limit . . . (inaudible) . . . property line. That's 60 dba. The orange line is we measured the noise levels from when they mowed the lawn of this green right here.

Mr. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: I'm sorry?

Mr. (____): There isn't a green.

Mr. Thompson: Well, the grass over there. The green line represents the measured noise levels here at Site 1 and Site 6. And the purple line is the predicted noise levels at each site.

Mr. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: So the predicted level is only the noise level from the different elements, from the zip line, from the different challenge elements without factoring in any of the nature sounds. If you add the two together, you do get about a half a decibel increase in noise levels.

Ms. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . . were you saying that the estimated noise level of the activity, is that including people?

Mr. Thompson: Yes, when I did measurement in Kualoa, I included measurements that had people hollering on it as they were going down to make sure that we included noise from not just the zip line itself . . . (inaudible) . . . to people yelling, or hollering, or whatever.

Mr. Gerald Rabaino: So you're saying Site 1 is quieter than Site 2? I mean Site 6?

Mr. Thompson: Site 1 is louder than Site 6. The green line is the measured values. . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Rabaino: This one is going down. . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: So the Site 1 is higher. This is the measured values all throughout the day that I was here. So this goes about 58 to about 53. This is about 54 to 40. So Site 6 is much quieter, about five decibels quieter.

Ms. McCrory: Okay, any other questions?

Ms. (____): Did you have winds the day you tested or did you have anything going on that's kind of normal here? It gets windy here.

Mr. Thompson: Sure, it was very breezy that day. More so at Site 2 on the map, and it kind of increased as we moved closer to here.

Ms. McCrory: Okay.

(Mechanical problems with the digital recorder.)

Ms. McCrory: Just in case you want to know what we're doing here. Just in case. These are the normal ponds that are around the Villas. These have been here forever. They're being . . . (inaudible) . . . That big shovel loader or whatever it is, is taking all of the dirt that has accumulated over the years and it is scooping it out, and then they will be relined and refilled.

What also will occur is if you look at the slanted portion here and you see the . . . (inaudible) . . . that's kind of brown and green standing up, that's the water fall. So this will be one waterfall that will be closest to the Villas. There will be another waterfall at that end also. And in between these two and all the way up, there will be two more waterfalls. So I don't know how pleasant people think water sounds are; I happen to like them. But you will have even more . . . (inaudible) . . . sounds as I call them that you're going to hear.

Ms. (____): Is that included in your studies, those waterfalls?

Ms. McCrory: No, because we don't have.

Ms. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Thompson: So those are harder to predict. They will definitely raise the level, the nature sound noise level here in the area, which may make it a little harder to perceive any noises from the adventure park.

Mr. Green: So you have to create more noise to . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. McCrory: No, you've had these waterfalls, guys. You know that.

Mr. Green: No, no, no, there's one.

Ms. McCrory: No, . . . (inaudible) . . . and there's two more further up, so those are up there. Okay.

The next two ponds that we're going to go pass beyond these two are recirculating. And you'll see one is huge and one is very small, but again, that will be a continuous recirculation. These two ponds actually drain out to . . . (inaudible) . . . So when you have, this is a part of the

drainage system here. So when you have very heavy rains, it's got to go somewhere. So that's part of what these two do, okay. And if you look on -- I don't know if you've been able to walk across on the other side, I mean, this has been draining for a week and a half, two weeks. But you can see the ditch line as it goes out and down. And then when you get to Lanai Avenue that one big culvert . . . (inaudible) . . . Okay? All right, we ready? Let's go, we're off.

1. **Lodge at Koele: Assemble at the Lanai Senior Center prior to 3:00 p.m., and depart promptly at 3:00 p.m. to visit the proposed Koele Adventure Center location. (See Item 1 on [attached map](#) for assembly location.)**

(The Commission assembled at Site 2, the proposed Adventure location at approximately 3:45 p.m.)

Ms. Ann Cua: . . . (inaudible) . . . and that's what they're coming to the Commission for. If they don't get the Special Use Permit, they cannot utilize the Adventure Center. So, they can't . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. (____): So all these tests that you were doing, you weren't even . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. McCrory: I won't even tell you what they costs. . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Erik Marter: . . . (inaudible) . . . with grading. Since they were redoing the ponds no matter what, they put the footings in there. . . . (inaudible) . . . and putting the footings later. So that's a cost that if it goes away, it goes away. Nothing else is going to get built until this group has done due diligence. It's not like everything is getting built up and creating everything . . . (inaudible) . . . No. What we are doing though is we didn't want to go back and redo that ponds later. . . . (inaudible) . . . to add extra bricks in there than it is to tear the whole thing up and do it again.

Ms. (____): But in November it wasn't even started. So why did you . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Marter: All this is all grading and . . . (inaudible) . . . work it does not need to go through the County Special Use -- the Planning Department.

Ms. McCrory: The grading permit was granted.

Mr. (____): That's for the culvert, drainage, all the drainage.

Ms. McCrory: That's for all of this, all the drainage, everything. It's a huge grading permit.

Mr. (____): Eric, what are all those supports for?

Mr. Marter: Those are for towers for the poles to come up that runs the adventure center.

Ms. McCrory: If you've got your sheet, it's in your sheet. It's in the second packet. Okay, can everybody hear Erik? Talk louder. Erik louder.

Mr. Green: That looks like a tower.

Mr. Marter: It's like that, but it not, it's not. It doesn't look like that, but that's the general idea. . . . (inaudible) . . . steel members, kind of like these but a little less obtrusive. You see the grayish ones, the light gray, that's a . . . (inaudible) . . . walk so this gets refilled. So that's a boardwalk that comes down to a large deck and then . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. (____): Filled with water?

Mr. Marter: Yeah, then this will be water. So it actually sits on water. And then these poles stick up 35 feet. It's a little bit less than these trees. Yes, there's a pole in the middle, and then there's . . . (inaudible) . . . course elements. People go up there and get clipped in, and go from one to the next, to the next.

Mr. (____): Oh, I see, okay. It has nothing to do with the zip line.

Mr. Marter: No, no. So the zip line then -- you guys are ready for that? The zip line starts right on top of this hill, and it goes right over our heads right here. And then it lands right where the people in the yellow are down there. So there's four of them that go down. Two of you can lie face first and you cruise down to the bottom and land . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. (____): Now I understand better. Thank you.

Mr. Marter: Yeah, so the noise that we've been making right here while we're having side conversations is more than the noise you will find on the tower with 10 people on it, or 15 people. They're not out there yelling and screaming on that.

Mr. (____): Are you sure?

Mr. Marter: Oh, I am sure. I've spent my life on these things. 52 years old, this is all I have done all my life. . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Rabaino: I'm going to come one day and . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Marter: . . . (inaudible) . . . cross these elements to challenge themselves to get from one side to the other. They're very focused while they're doing it. There's not a --. It's a quiet focused element.

Mr. Rabaino: How many people going be on that tower? Because you guys going do it in groups right?

Mr. Marter: Yeah, yeah. It's going to vary. We don't really know the max numbers. When we get into it, we're going to probably be right around, I would say, 15 at a time. Again, considerably bigger than this group.

Mr. Rabaino: . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Marter: Yeah, a small group.

Ms. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . .

Mr. Marter: It's all going to be landscaped.

Ms. (____): Bushes . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. McCrory: Let me address the trees. One of the things that we're going to be doing --. One of the things that we're going to be doing is removing invasive species. We . . . (inaudible) . . . we've got a lot of them all over the place. And we're going to be planting native species. We don't think --

Ms. (____): . . . (inaudible) . . . barge today. Don't say that.

Ms. McCrory: We don't think that will make a difference in the sound transmission because as Christian said you needed --

Mr. Thompson: 100 of feet of very thick dense foliage to really make a difference.

Ms. (____): (inaudible) . . . dirt, and run off and rain.

Ms. McCrory: Can I ask everybody to listen? Erik, could you talk about what's going to go in the . . . (inaudible) . . . over here? You can see the signs, Nitro Crossing --. I can't see the others. Nitro crossing, catwalk, diversity trail and I can't read through the door -- junk yard.

Mr. Rabaino: We're going to the junk yard?

Ms. McCrory: It's one of the challenge elements.

Mr. Rabaino: You said a 100 feet. Okay, so the tower is there and . . . (inaudible) . . . those threes a 100 feet, right? So you have a dense forest there.

Ms. McCrory: Erik, go ahead.

Mr. Marter: . . . (Inaudible) . . . So the challenge course is three main components of the adventure center. One is the zip lines. It's easy to understand. A lot of people see those --

Ms. (____): You said zip lines.

Mr. Marter: Yeah, as I mentioned. There's four of them all side by side. So two of them you're seated, and two of them you're lying down. So you have four people go down at once, or two people go down at once.

Ms. Green: They go down simultaneously or one after the other?

Mr. Marter: Either one. And then the adventure tower is another one of the components. And then the third one is a team building challenge course component. Most of that is based in the woods. So if you look at this picture here, if you look up and in there, that's a challenge course element. It's called a high v. People will climb up a tree together. They'd be in a harness, they would have cable above them, and they lean against each other. And the farther they walk, the farther the cables go out, the harder they gets. Now the whole discussion about how far can we can go, and it gets a little more challenging, and they give it their best, and then they come down to the group. . . . (inaudible) . . . and lowers them to the ground. The other one has a trapeze in it where they climb up a tree on some pegs on the tree and they stand on a platform and jump off and . . . (inaudible) . . . trapeze. Those are the kind of elements that go in there.

One of them is called a junk yard. . . . (inaudible) . . . the best name. But essentially like a cargo net, and a couple of beams, and a couple of posts that you climb. If two people do it at a time, and they're helping each other get up that thing together as they do an activity.

Ms. Catiel: Is there enough clearing for all of that?

Mr. Marter: Yeah.

Ms. Catiel: Okay, you guys aren't cutting any trees down, right?

Mr. Marter: No. There's on that's dead that's going to come out but that's it.

Ms. Catiel: Yeah, don't harm the trees.

Ms. McCrory: No, the arborist came out and checked every tree. Because we knew that site . . . (inaudible) . . . and deal with whatever. He checked every tree.

Ms. Trevino: And so the trees are being used for like the climbing and support . . . (inaudible) . . . ?

Mr. Marter: Yeah.

Ms. Trevino: So you are going to be taking branches off them?

Mr. Marter: A few. We don't need to take too many off. The ones that are already dead. So you guys have heard of an arborist before? We're working the consulting arborist. It's a very different human being. The difference would be like an arborist with a high school diploma kind of a thing. The consulting arborist essentially has a PhD in trees. So, we have one of the top of the country to make sure what we're doing isn't hurting the trees and that the trees are . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. (____): How long does it take to go down?

Mr. Marter: I'm trying to remember. 40 seconds.

Ms. (____): Yeah, how many miles per hour is that?

Mr. Marter: When we hit the middle, 28, 30 or something like that.

Ms. (____): You can go that fast on your bike.

Mr. Marter: You can right? Because as you do it, it feels so much longer, right? Because your memory, your memory is just tracking stuff so well. It's pretty cool.

Ms. McCrory: Okay, I don't know if you noticed there were other signs further down as we came up. If you didn't see them, they're a little further down beside the pond. I wanted to point out the waterfall on this pond. If you go all the way to the back where the guys are working you can see how it drops, and then it drops again, and then it goes over here and it drops again. At the other end of this pond, because these two are the re-circulating ponds, and it drops to another waterfall again. Once again, lots of waterfall noise is going to be going.

And then one other point as we go back down, I want to talk is the welcome center. We went past that as we came up. It will be on the left going down, and there's like 82 parking spaces that are now filled with construction trailers. So if you see construction trailers, that's where all the parking will be.

Ms. Trevino: So the current, where the parking was.

Ms. McCrory: Yeah, where the parking was. Exactly. Okay.

Mr. Rabaino: Erik?

Mr. Marter: Yes?

Mr. Rabaino: When we have tropical storms, we're in the mountain range, will all that rain water by pass this and drain down or will certain areas be flooded?

Mr. Marter: I'm confident that our landscape architect is not going to let all of this plants and everything get torn apart. They're planning very well for that.

Mr. Rabaino: And what is this grading over here, is that for electric or drainage?

Mr. Marter: This piece right here?

Mr. Rabaino: Right.

Mr. Marter: That's the old cart path. So they just tore the old cart path up. They had electrical wires along the entire cart path that are all getting pulled out.

Ms. McCrory: And the cart paths will be enlarged throughout here because as you start to go further up for the sculpture garden, they're going to be enlarged.

Ms. Trevino: And then is there still going to be access for hiking to Koloiki and stuff through here?

Ms. McCrory: Yeah, that won't change.

Ms. Trevino: Okay.

Ms. McCrory: It just stopped because of construction.

Ms. Trevino: Yeah, yeah. No, I just wasn't sure if --

Mr. Marter: You just can't sneak and ride the zip line.

Ms. Trevino: Well that's why I was going to say because like if you walk through the park area it's like . . . (inaudible) . . .

Ms. McCrory: We are running late so let us go.

2. **Koele Stables: Assemble at 3:45 p.m. or thereafter on Keomoku Road across from the Koele Stables. (See Item 2 on [attached map](#) for assembly location.)**

(The Commission assembled at Site 3, The Koele Stables, at approximately 4:00 p.m.)

Ms. McCrory: . . . (inaudible) . . . address the noise and the alternative sites. This was one of the site that was mentioned by the Planning Department as being one because . . . (inaudible) . . . It's fairly close, but as you can see, it is devoid of trees. So the only way you can do something here is to put up a . . . (inaudible) . . . in the middle of everywhere. And no way to

do a zip line without building a mountain of dirt. At the same time look how close Iwiolo, the Quad, and DHHL is, with absolutely nothing in between. So, we didn't think made any sense. Besides all that, we just did all of these new paddocks and pasture areas. We're doing a whole new plan on how we keep moving the various animals. The horses, the miniature horses, the miniature donkeys to different areas. Yeah, they love to be petted, but they feel really bad. You know, they've kind of been rolling in the dirt the way I would describe it. So unless you want a lot of red dirt.

We're leaving to one other alternative site.

- Lanai Archery & Sporting Range: Assemble at 4:00 p.m. or thereafter on Keomoku Road across from the Koele Stables. (See Item 3 on [attached map](#) for assembly location.)**

The Commission assembled at Site 4, Lanai Archery and Sporting Range (LASR), at approximately 4:05 p.m.)

Ms. McCrory: . . . (inaudible) . . . Delacruz suggested. It's called LASR. It's Lanai Archery and Shooting Range. It's exactly what it says it is; it's guns. It is shot guns, shooting skeet. It is archery on courses. It's 15 acres of shooting. What will also go in here is a large fire range for pistols. And guess what's around it? Hunting area. All of this is hunting area, in this whole area. Now we have on this site which is completely used by LASR, the 15 acres, but if you go beyond this, you get into the hunting area, the game management area, the shot rifles and the archery.

Ms. (____): And who determines that?

Ms. McCrory: The game management is with the State. So all of that is there. And I don't know how many people hunt in this group. I don't know if you know hunters. But they are very, very, very focused on having lots of area to hunt. They don't want people walking through their area. They consider it to be dangerous. You're just scaring the hunting animals. So it's not a matter that this makes sense.

The other issue with this one is the distance. It's a long way away. The other issue is by the time we grade something, it would cost a fortune, and it totally needs infrastructure for something else. This barely has enough infrastructure to keep it going. We don't have enough even water up here to water and turn irrigation on. So, it's an expensive one, so we eliminated this one. Guns is not where you want people dealing with wellness resources. It doesn't make sense.

Okay, that's it. We're ready to go back.

C. NEXT REGULAR MEETING DATE: March 20, 2019 at 5:00 p.m. at the Lanai Senior Center.

D. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further discussion brought forward to the Commission, the meeting was adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by,

LEILANI A. RAMORAN-QUEMADO
Secretary to Boards and Commissions II

RECORD OF ATTENDANCE

PRESENT:

Roxanne Catiel
Caron Green, Chair
Sherry Menze
Shelly Preza, Vice-Chair
Gerald Rabaino
Shirley Samonte
Chelsea Trevino

EXCUSED:

John Delacruz
Mililani Martin

OTHERS:

Ann Cua, Planning Supervisor, Current Planning Division
Jared Burkett, Staff Planner
Richelle Thomson, Deputy Corporation Counsel